

Third Party Evaluator's Opinion on Merak Bakauheni Ferry Terminal Extension Project (2)

Gen. TNI Surjadi Soedirdja
Minister of Internal Affairs at Persatuan Indonesia Cabinet, 1999-2001
Governor of Jakarta in the period of 1992-1997
Adviser to the President of The Republic of Indonesia

Relevance

Merak-Bakauheni ferry is a very important distribution centre and transportation channel in Indonesia, which is connecting Sumatra and Java, considerably categorized as the most crowded and high traffic ferry in the Southeast Asia. Almost 3, 500 vehicles going through this harbor every day, transporting as many as 13,000 to 15,000 passengers a day. This number is a 150% increase of that in the periods of 1980-1990, with the average number of passengers of 9,000-10,000 a day. On the Holidays, the number of passengers may reach 80,000 a day. This number is a 200% increase compare to 1980-1990 period, whose number is 40,000-42,000 a day. Big ferry vessels are leaving every 18 minutes and 30 minutes for small vessels. In the view of policy consistence, construction of Merak-Bakauheni Ferry Harbor includes terminal is in line with ODA Policy to support the GOI policy on economic growth through provision of infrastructure and to stimulate investment. It shows that the project has provided support to the mobilization and development of regional economy. As well as, it constitute the consistency of Japanese Government in supporting such infrastructure since 1976, the year when this harbor was constructed for the first time using Japanese funds. Merak-Bakauheni ferry harbor is officially opened in 1981 and significantly facilitates transportation between the two biggest islands in Indonesia, both in wide area and is highly inhabited. The presence of Merak-Bakauheni harbor have had supported the proximity of remote areas as is radius and people mobility is getting better, in addition to better distribution of goods and services. It is clearly indicates a very significant mobilization of the people takes place between the two islands, especially people from middle and lower class that have had family relationship which people transmigrated from Java to Sumatra since beginning 1990s. Almost all provinces in Sumatra are now occupied by those coming from Java through transmigration program, who still have connection and kinship with the people living in Java Island. Considering that transmigrated people has low purchasing power, the presence of this ferry harbor is very important for them. In national spatial plan, Merak-Bakauheni subsystem constitutes an important point in national transportation system as well as to build and maintain the national integration of the Republic of Indonesia.

Impact

The presence of Merak-Bakauheni harbor, as well as the smoothness and convenience it gives is very important for Indonesian community, especially those domiciling in Sumatra, considering the live history of those coming from Java Island in transmigration program. As well as, people in Sumatra region carried out their activity in Java, such as, those working in Tangerang, an industrial centre, so that the relationship between the two islands, Sumatra and Java, becomes highly in frequency. It positively stimulates inter-island trade development in Indonesia and economic development because of the increasing traders at the port as well as development of tourism destinations of small to middle scale units such as : resort, tourism spots, Hotels, and restaurants.

Sustainability

Harbor management is fully handled by PT. ASDP under supervision of department of Transportation which covers regulating and implementing. For this purposes, is necessary to be deepened more accurate on the aspect of regulation that should consider community need so that the regulation produced may accurately meet the people needs. The maintenance of the harbor could also be supported under the regional cooperation of both provincial governments, Banten dan Lampung which takes benefits from the presence of the harbor..

**THIRD PARTY EVALUATION ON
MERAK-BAKAUHENI
FERRY TERMINAL EXTENSION PROJECT (2) , JBIC**

By SURJADI SOEDIRDJA*)

*) **Surjadi Soedirdja** is Minister of Domestic Affairs at Persatuan Indonesia Cabinet and Governor of Special Region of Jakarta Capital in the period of 1992-1997. He is currently involved in social and national activities and giving advice to the President of the Republic of Indonesia.

I. BACKGROUND, OBJECTIVE, AND OBSERVATION METHODS

Evaluation on Merak-Bakauheni Ferry Terminal Project, is conducted in accordance with JBIC demand as a third party opinion over such project after completion of project and it's post evaluation in overall. In line with its objective. The third party evaluation is made using project functional target approach, that is, viewed from the aspect of project relevance, impact and sustainability. For this purpose, the evaluation is made by way of studying program evaluation (desk study) and field study (field check) by field observation at the location of Merak and Bakauheni harbors. Study is conducted at both terminals, Merak in Banten Province and Bakauheni in Lampung Province. There are two kinds of data collection used in this study, namely primary and secondary data. Collection of primary data is made through interview and observation at the site. Interview is made purposively with respondents, that is, people consider knowing much about the condition at Merak-Bakauheni Ferry Harbor and user of transportation service of Merak-Bakauheni ferry. The respondents are passengers who are students, traders, factory workers, employees of private company. In addition to interview, there is also dialog with respondents. In this opportunity, various questions are asked, both informative and confirmative questions, to users of such ferry transportation service. In addition to interview, method of collecting primary data is also made through observation. Observation is conducted at the condition of the harbors, ferry vessel used, and services given to ferry services user. Result of observation is added to other primary data and to the analysis. To furnish primary data, various secondary data is collected, among others, from **PT. Angkutan Sungai Danau dan Penyeberangan (PT. ASDP)**, The Association of River, Lake, and Ferry Transportation Businessmen (Gapasdap) of Merak Branch, Directorate of Sea Transportation, Directorate of Land Transportation, Department of Transportation, and from analysis on regulation.

II GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF MERAK-BAKAUHENI HARBORS

Merak-Bakauheni ferry is a very important distribution centre and transportation channel in Indonesia. Merak-Bakauheni Ferry is the main connection facility and one of the center of distribution in Western Indonesia, which is connecting Sumatra and Java, as well as other Indonesia territory. Merak-Bakauheni ferry is generally categorized as the most crowded ferry in the sense of intensively used by the beneficiaries, in Southeast Asia. Activities in the harbor cover ferry for ferry, vehicle and merchandise between Merak-Bakauheni connecting Java Island and Sumatra Island. In other words, transportation activity for passengers and vehicles is the main activity of Merak Harbor, especially by the unification of intercity bus terminal facility with railway station in this area. Other activity of this harbor is merchandise loading-unloading.

The existing service activities in Merak Harbor cover:

- Vessel service consisting of services for vessel tying up, tether, tugboat, towing, and vessel telephone.
- Merchandise services consisting of: piling and pier.
- Equipment services consisting of: onshore crane, offshore crane, forklift, head truck, chassis, barge, BKPM (coupling motorboat of B type), tractor towing, weighing, and fire extinguishing.
- Terminal services consisting of stevedoring, cargodoring, receiving, delivery, and overbrenge.
- Container services consisting of loading/unloading, container movement, piling, and mechanic.
- Premises services consisting of: land rental and building rental.
- Other services consisting of harbor document, vehicle retribution, and telephone extension.

Ferry harbor is equipped with support facilities such as pier for Roll on and Roll off (Ro-Ro) vessels and speedboats, passenger counter and tool gate for vehicles, weighing facility, lighting (PLN and generator set), CCTV monitor, fire extinguisher, ambulance, patrol vehicle, VIP Room facility and waiting room for public, vessel fleet (Roll on and Roll off (Ro-Ro) vessels and speedboats) and onshore fleet (AKDP buses, executive taxi, and village transportation).

Figure 1, Lay out of Bakauheni port and the ferry Ro-Ro facility (June 2005).

Merak-Bakauheni ferry harbor is managed by PT ASDP. Merak-Bakauheni terminal is the largest terminal connecting to big islands, Java and Sumatra. Almost 3, 500 vehicles going through this harbor every day, transporting as many as 13,000 to 15,000 passengers a day. This number is a 150% increase of that in the periods of 1980-1990, with the average number of passengers of 9,000-10,000 a day. On the Holidays, the number of passengers may reach 80,000 a day. This number is a 200% increase compare to 1980-1990 period, whose number is 40,000-42,000 a day. Big ferry vessels are leaving every 18 minutes and 30 minutes for small vessels.

III. ANALYSIS ON PROJECT FUNCTIONAL TARGET

3.1. THE RELEVANCE

a. Policy Consistency

Construction of Merak-Bakauheni Ferry Harbor includes terminal is in line with ODA Policy to support economic growth through provision of infrastructure and to stimulate investment. Merak-Bakauheni line constitutes the center of Indonesian service distribution, especially in the western part. It shows that the project has provided support to the mobilization and development of regional economy. As a vital infrastructure, a harbor is very important for developing territories and economy. Construction of Merak-Bakauheni ferry harbor using ODA constitutes the consistency of Japanese Government in supporting such infrastructure since 1977, the year

when this harbor was constructed for the first time using Japanese funds. Merak-Bakauheni ferry harbor is officially opened in 1981 after completion of significant infrastructure of Java-Bali and significantly facilitates transportation between the two biggest islands in Indonesia, both in wide area and population. The presence of Merak-Bakauheni harbor has supported the proximity of remote areas as its radius and people mobility is getting better, in addition to better distribution of goods and services.

Table 1. Traffics, Passenger, Goods, and Vehicles going through Bakauheni Port, 1999 to 2003

Year	Passenger (people)		Goods (Tons)		Vehicle (Unit)	
	Increase	Decrease	Loading	Unloading	Increase	Decrease
2003	4,747,297	4,295,547	4,519,135	3,250,566	1,023,878	1,159,606
2002	5,264,524	4,065,815	4,114,240	3,051,989	1,046,703	1,022,586
2001	5,998,095	4,621,697	4,048,263	2,726,441	1,088,341	1,087,046
2000	7,445,212	5,903,233	3,967,784	3,441,590	1,093,454	1,136,071
1999	8,342,408	7,988,800	2,923,948	2,816,837	931,824	897,388
Source : Lampung Province in Figures, BPS (Central Bureau of Statistics), 2003						

b. Contribution to National Development

Very significant mobilization of the people takes place between the two islands, especially of middle class and lower class that have had family relationship which people transmigrated from Java to Sumatra since beginning 1990s. Thanks to the smooth Sumatra-Java sea transportation through Merak-Bakauheni harbor, this facility is very significant to ordinary people. Considering that transmigrated people has low purchasing power, the presence of this ferry harbor is very important for them and it gives very relevant meaning in fulfilling people needs. In the national spatial layout, Merak-Bakauheni subsystem constitutes an important point in national transportation system. Merak-Bakauheni harbor is important not only in developing economy, but also in building up and maintaining national integration of the Republic of Indonesia. Effectiveness of RO-RO harbor constitutes an important opportunity for the government and the community in mobilizing the people nationwide and in distributing goods and services to the people and for national economic growth.

3.2. IMPACT

a. Support in People Mobilization in Transmigration program and in Kinship System.

The presence of Merak-Bakauheni harbor, as well as the smoothness and convenience it gives is very important for Indonesian community, especially those domiciling in Sumatra, considering the live history of those coming from Java Island in transmigration program. Almost all provinces in Sumatra are now occupied by those coming from Java through transmigration program, who still have connection and kinship with the people living in Java Island. On the other hand, people in Sumatra region carried out their activity in Java, such as, those working in Tangerang, an industrial centre, so that the relationship between the two islands, Sumatra and Java, becomes very intensive, stimulated by the presence of such harbor. It can be seen clearly at the time of national holidays or school holidays.

Based on observation at Merak-Bakauheni harbor that belongs to PT ASDP, Merak-Bakauheni ferry in June is not well suited to their operational plan and resulting any interruption. Based on information from Mr. Teja Suparna, operational Manager of Merak Harbor, there are 20 ferry vessels of Roll On-Roll off (Ro-Ro) type and four reserve vessels, as well as 14 speedboats are ready to fulfill demand of ferry services, boats, going to and coming from Sumatra Island.

Figure 2 Passengers getting off a speedboat arrive at Bakauheni.

Ro-Ro vessels are capable of serving 90 trips a day, while speedboats 97 trips, serve at four piers at Merak harbor. If demand is increasing, such as at the time of Islamic Holiday, the Ramadhan or Christmas and New Year Eve, frequency of vessels trips can be maximized up to 100 trips a day.

Figure 3. Ferry facilities: fast ferry passenger (up) and Ro-Ro ferry (bellow).

Based on frequency of ferry service, it is seen that people use it regularly once a week, or several times a months for going to work/business trip, but there is also ferry service at school holiday or Islamic Holiday, that is, once or twice a year. From the aspect of alternative transportation, users of ferry service, especially passengers, say that they prefer ferry because it is cheaper and economical compare to flying. Users of ferry service have the options to use big ferry vessel and speedboat. Some of them say that they use big vessel because it is cheaper, but the others choose speedboat because they want to arrive sooner.

In general, ferry harbor has been functioning well both in assisting service user to go across from Merak to Bakauheni Harbor or the other way round. The use of speedboat is enthusiastically received by the community because it is more comfortable and arrives at the destination faster. Speedboat is cleaner than large ferry vessel. However, from the view point of convenience, it is lack because the facility such as toilet, waiting room, and canteen are unsatisfactory. Users of ferry service also feel that the security is lack because there are many

criminal actions taking place in the harbor. Most facilities in the harbor are in bad repair. Departure schedule of ferry vessel is not stable yet, sometimes it is on time, sometimes, it is not. Sometimes there is long line at the pier so as to slow down arrival schedule at the harbor. Based on observation on vessels condition used in Merak-Bakauheni ferry and interview as well as field observation, most large Ferry vessels used are old. In the mean time, replacing them with the new ones takes time and a lot of fund so that the operator have difficulty in replacing such vessels.

c. Support in Inter-island Trade as an Alternative of Panjang Harbor as Sea Harbor/Export Harbor.

Prior to the presence of Bakauheni Harbor, all connection between Java and Sumatra is conducted through Panjang Harbor, with in National transportation system belongs to sea harbor, as a harbor for export and import. Separation of Bakauheni Harbor from Panjang Harbor in Sumatra is positively stimulate inter-island trade development in Indonesia. The activity of Bakauheni Harbor is increasing from time to time, as can be seen from data on merchandise volume increase. Inter-island trade between Sumatra and Java at the same time indicates demand of national transportation, not only for the people, but also for their daily needs. In this matter, Sumatra position as the supplier of goods to Java Island, or the other way round in the case of commodity from Java to satisfied demand of Sumatra people.

d. Generating Other Economic Activities.

Merak-Bakauheni transportation line has stimulated economic development because of the increasing traders at the port as well as development of tourism destinations of small to middle scale. Data indicating the arising tourism destinations both in Bakauheni and Merak, is in form of resorts, venture tourism spots, Hotels, and restaurants.

3.3. Sustainability

Study on sustainability aspects are conducted using the approach of public facility maintenance aspect, relationship between harbor administrator and city and provincial government, the aspect of ferry management and the aspect of security check, as well as ASDP response to the plan to build a bridge across Sunda Strait.

In the aspect of maintenance, there are problems arisen, including security disturbance and the lack of fund for maintenance. Institutionally, the party implementing the activity in harbor is PT ASDP (Persero), State-own Enterprise. PT. ASDP is responsible for managing the port and facilitating traffic of passengers and goods between Merak and Bakauheni, and the other way round. PT.ASDP has a vision to become reliable ferry operator and sailing operator, capable of giving value added to stakeholder, while its missions are, among others:

- To improve competitiveness through product and service innovation to provide quality, competitive service.
- To manage business portfolio using modern management and professional workers in order to maximize value added for stakeholder proportionally.
- To give contribution to national development through government assignment in ferry services sector.

The principal duty of PT.ASDP (Persero) is to implement business activity of harbor facility maintenance service in line with stipulated business policy. Meanwhile, the functions of PT.ASDP are, among others:

- Providing service for River, Lake, and Ferry transportation.
- Providing facilities for repair and maintenance of vessels and other support equipment, both for itself(PT ASDP) and for other parties.
- Providing and procuring terminal services, pure services and other facilities for vessel activity, passengers coming and going, as well as vehicle and loading/unloading of merchandise/livestock.
- Providing and procuring harbor pools, harbors waters to facilitate traffic and the arrival of ferry vessel.
- Other efforts necessary for supporting harbor service.

Bakauheni Ferry Harbor is General Harbor serving ferry between the southern tip of Sumatra Island and the western tip of Java Island for public interest. Bakauheni ferry harbor is managed by BUMN (State-own Enterprise), namely, PT ASDP (Persero), officially operating in 1981. In the beginning of its operation, ASDP is under the Directorate General of Land Transportation, later being under UPT Ditendat under Regional Office of Department of Transportation VII of Lampung Province. Based on Government Regulation Number 8/1986, the management is given to Perum ASDP as a BUMN under the Department of Transportation and pursuant to government regulation number 15/1992, the status of Perum ASDV is changed into PT. Angkutan Sungai, danau, dan Penyeberangan (Persero) or PT. ASDP (Persero).

Harbor management is fully handled by PT. ASDP under supervision of department of Transportation. In such management format, PT. ASDP is conducting the management starting from arrangement up to implementation of the management, which, for this purpose, is necessary to be deepened accurately at the aspect of arrangement, that should consider community need so that the regulation produced is accurately meet to the people need.

Another potential assistance to the maintenance and the sustainability of Merak-Bakauheni Harbor is from the regional cooperation, in this matter between Lampung Provincial Government and Banten Provincial Government, by entering into a memorandum of understanding regarding support for the plan to improve and develop facilities and infrastructure of transportation connecting the two islands (Sumatra-Java). The two regions realized the necessity to improve service of transportation facility and infrastructure in other form, which is technologically and economically feasible and possible. The scope of Lampung-Banten cooperation covers joint coordination and consultation to central government regarding strategic matters. This cooperation covers also the facility and coordination with relevant stakeholder, with respect to the plan to improve and/or develop transportation facility and infrastructure connecting Lampung with Banten. This agreement applies for two years since the signing, and it maybe renewed in accordance with agreement based on annual evaluation.

Community participation in keeping and maintaining the harbor is conducted without special program. The efforts made by harbor management are to appeal community consciousness to maintain the security of their own belongings, as well as to maintain order during the journey. So far PT. ASDP has cooperated with the Republic of Indonesia State Police and KAMLA (Sea Security Police) to secure the harbors, both in Merak and Bakauheni. Several others activity in progress in the community in maintaining and supporting harbor security are, among others, private support in form of car repair service, such as that by Toyota Astra and health services activity conducted by community social organization, especially at the peak period of holiday.

In connection with the expectation of Lampung Provincial Government to built Sunda Strait Bridge whose length is about 27 km, based on field observation and discussion with PT. ASDP, it basically can be projected that such channel can be done using the format of inter-mode transportation system, which means that it can be done using toll route system and special ferry for passengers and goods. Toll fee consideration will become an indicator of community option for desired transportation model.

IV PROBLEMS

4.1. Worthiness of Harbor and Ferry

In line with the increasing number of passengers and goods going through Merak-Bakauheni Harbor, it is felt that there is lack of piers. It is seen from the long line of passengers and vehicles that will go across. For this purpose, PT Angkutan Sungai Danau dan Penyeberangan (ASDP). Indonesian Ferry of Merak Branch is planning to add another pier from four to five in

anticipating holiday season and Islamic Holiday Season. The objective of constructing new pier is to open shipping line pioneer in Lampung. In addition, this new pier will be used as the facility for speedboat ferry because up to now speedboat is using pier one. Therefore, in the future, there will be a separate pier. The plan to build the piers will be realized in 2007. Central office of ASDP is currently studying the budget required.

The piers is expected capable of solving the classical problem frequently takes place in Merak Harbor, namely, traffic jam and overcrowded vehicles going to the harbor. According to PT. ASDP, about 15% of the 24 Ro-Ro vessels in Merak are in critical condition. Condition of such vessel is under the standard stipulated by ASDP for serving Merak-Bakauheni ferry harbor. In the third week of July this year it was published in the newspaper covering long queues of trucks and cars for a week due to technical problems at pier 4, which has finally could be solved. It gives sign that the importance of adequately facilities for the optimum services.

4.2. Fare Problem

The problem of fare is often complained by truck crews going across Merak-Bakauheni ferry. Fare problem is actually stipulated in the meeting at PT.Pelindo Panjang, in which it is stipulated a 400% increase for the fare of Bakauheni-Merak. This policy is inevitable because the long distance has made operating cost of the vessel is increasing four times as much. For information, the distance between Merak Harbor and Bakauheni Harbor is merely 15 miles, while to Panjang Harbor 54 miles with time period of 5-6 hours a trip based on such meeting, vehicles will be imposed a fare of V and VI category.

Previously, the fare for V category for vehicles of Fuso Type if passengers using Ro-Ro vessel from Merak harbor to Bakauheni harbor is 250.000. rupiahs. If using ferry to Panjang Harbor is 958.000 rupiahs. Meanwhile the cost increase for category VI for Tronton vehicle and large truck, the cost is increased from 350.000 to 1.448.000 rupiahs.

V. CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

In general, it can be concluded that Merak Bakauheni Ferry and Harbor is considerably urgent for the community. Such ferry and harbor are very useful for the people living in the two islands, both for people and merchandise traffic, especially for ordinary people whose accessibility is very limited.

Merak-Bakauheni ferry has become an alternative transportation to the people because of its being low prices and efficient compare to air transportation. Moreover, there are currently speedboat ferry so that users of ferry service may arrive at the destination sooner, namely at

Merak and bakauheni.

Merak-Bakauheni ferry and harbor has a strategic function to connect economic activity between Java and Sumatra Islands. Therefore, the smoothness of the ferry plays an important role in facilitating economic activity between the two islands.

Based on field survey, improvement measures are necessary in order to improve the quality of ferry and harbor service between Merak and Bakauheni, comprising:

1. In general, it is necessary to modernize the management system in all journey activities, including for convenience and esthetic, considering that passengers comes from and go to the next transportation facility directly in their way to their destination.
2. It is necessary to improve security for passengers because during this time there are security violation such as theft and other criminal actions.
3. It is necessary to regenerate the old vessel so as to secure the safety and the convenience of users of ferry and harbor service.
4. It is necessary to maintain and repair public facilities in the harbor.
5. Outside intervention (from government, NGO, Various stakeholders, etc) to monitor the implementation of harbor and ferry activity is necessary, especially in the aspect of service and people needs.
6. It is necessary to intensify cooperation between ASDP and Police in order to maintain security at the harbor and during the journey.
7. It is necessary to improve managerial aspect of harbor management, both in Merak and Bakauheni.

Jakarta, August 2005