



Senior Secondary Education Project

Contributing to human resource development of the young population in Uzbekistan by expanding Secondary Specialized Professional Education system through teachers' trainings, etc.

[External Evaluator]

Hajime Onishi and Kazuyoshi Inokuchi, Mitsubishi UFJ Research and Consulting Co., Ltd.

Rating

Effectiveness, Impact	b	Overall Rating C
Relevance	a	
Efficiency	b	
Sustainability	b	

Project Objectives

To develop human resources necessary for the transition toward a market-oriented economy by providing overseas training for teachers and instructors and educational equipment at 50 model agricultural Professional Colleges (PCs), central to the ongoing educational reform in Uzbekistan, and thereby contributing to the development of the market-oriented economy.

Outline of the Loan Agreement

- Loan amount / Disbursed amount: 6,347 million yen / 5,973 million yen
- Loan agreement: January 2001
- Terms and conditions: 0.75% interest rate; 40-year repayment period (including a 10-year grace period); bilateral tied
- Final disbursement date: September 2005
- Executing agency: Ministry of Higher and Secondary Specialized Education (MHSSE), The Center of Secondary Specialized Professional (Vocational) Education (CSSVE)

Effects of Project Implementation (Effectiveness, Impact)

The indicator of "actual number of students per number of students at full capacity" in 2008 was 170% on average in 50 target PCs, which was drastically worse than 80% at the time of project appraisal in 2001 and is below the target value of 120%. Also, the indicator of "increase rate of the number of PCs" in 2008 is reported as 355%, which has not achieved the target value of 464%. Moreover, it is pointed out that some of the procured equipment (especially food processing equipment) is not properly used and the curriculum of many PCs has not yet been made in a manner that effectively utilizes the procured equipment.

On the other hand, according to a beneficiary survey, positive effects were recognized, such as enhancement in the quality of course content, improvement in the performance of teachers and students, improvement in the management of PCs, and positive impacts on businesses of private companies that hired graduates of PCs. Therefore, this project has produced certain effects, and its effectiveness is moderate.

Relevance

This project has been highly relevant with Uzbekistan's national policies and development needs at the times of both appraisal and ex-post evaluation. There has been no significant change in the educational policy of Uzbekistan and the development of industrial human resources, meeting the changes in the market economy is still regarded as one of the most urgent issues to tackle.

Efficiency

The actual period was slightly longer than planned and the project cost exceeded the plan; therefore the evaluation for efficiency is moderate. The background to the increase in the total cost was extra civil works at some PCs. In addition, the cost to construct new PCs exceeded the originally expected cost.

Sustainability

In the short run, there are some issues in i) continuous transfer of operation skills regarding educational equipment among instructors, ii) difficulties of securing spare parts for some equipment, and iii) low level of operation and maintenance (O&M) of food processing equipment. On the other hand, it can be noted in the medium and long term that i) there is an adequate O&M budget from the central government, ii) the training system for teachers and instructors is well established, and iii) the positive effects arising from the additional assistance by JICA in 2007 are anticipated. Though some problems remain in the short run, sustainability of this project is fair.

Conclusion, Lessons Learned and Recommendations

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be fairly satisfactory. A major lesson learned is to allow a wide margin for risks in advance, especially in the former socialist countries such as the former Soviet Union where law enforcement and governmental administrative procedures are likely to require a long time.

Comparison of Operation and Effect Indicators

Operation & Effect Indicators (Unit)	Baseline (2001)		Target (Year: unknown)		Actual (October 2008)	
	National	Target PCs	National	Target PCs	National	Target PCs
Actual Number of Students per Number of Students at Full Capacity (%)	80	80	120	120	150	170
Increase rate in the Number of Students (%)	N.A.	N.A.	53	44	198	202
Increase in the Number of PCs	N.A.	N.A.	464	N.A.	355	N.A.

[Source] Answers to the questionnaire to CSSVE (Data on the increase in the Number of PCs is extracted from JICA internal documents)

*All ex-post evaluation reports including this can be referred to in JICA's website, "Evaluations"→"Ex-post Evaluation (ODA Loan)" ([URL:http://www.jica.go.jp/english/operations/evaluation/oda_loan/post/](http://www.jica.go.jp/english/operations/evaluation/oda_loan/post/))