Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Keiko Watanabe Foundation for Advanced Studies on International Development	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Construction of Multipurpose Cyclone Shelters (Phase V)	January 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	People's Republic of Bangladesh	
Project Period	November 2003-December 2006	
Implementing Agency	Local Government Engineering Department, Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development and Co-operatives (LGED/MLG&RD)	
Project Cost	Grant Limit: 645 million yen	Actual Grant Amount: 634.7 million yen
Main Contractors	Shimizu Corporation	
Main Consultants	Japan Engineering Consultants Co., Ltd.	
Basic Design	March-August 2003	
Related Projects (if any)	1. "The construction of multipurpose cyclone shelters" (Phase I-IV), Grant Aid (Japan) 2. "Multipurpose Cyclone Shelter Project" (World Bank and UNDP) There are a number of other projects to construct shelters with assistance from such development partners as EU, IFAD, Saudi Arabia, IDP, PEC, ADB, KfW, the Netherlands, and NGOs including BRAC, BDRCS, and Caritas.	
Project Background	Some 80% of the national land of Bangladesh lies less than 9 meters above sea level and has been greatly affected by cyclones both financially and socially, which makes flood control the utmost issue for the country. After the cyclone of 1991 that caused tremendous damage, the Bangladeshi government, with support from the World Bank and the UNDP, drew up a master plan to construct 2,500 multipurpose cyclone shelters and initiated the construction in cooperation with various development partners.	
Project Objective	To enable an increased number of people to evacuate and also improve the educational environment in primary schools by constructing 20 multipurpose cyclone shelters in the high-risk districts of Chittagong, Cox's Bazar and Noakhali.	
Output[s] (Japanese Side)	1. Construction of two-storied multipurpose cyclone shelters	2. Construction and procurement of auxiliary facilities such as water supply facilities, toilets and other school facilities.

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

The Project aimed to increase access of the people to evacuation facilities in case of cyclones by constructing multipurpose cyclone shelters in high-risk areas. It also contributes to the improvement of the educational environment in primary schools by making use of the buildings as schools at normal times. Therefore, the Project addressed the needs of Bangladesh. In addition, the Project was highly relevant to the Japanese government's policy of human security. Owing to its high relevance, it has delivered not only expected effects but indirect impacts. Furthermore, the Project has established a participatory system for routine operation and maintenance (O&M) in which, for example, residents bear the costs, and thereby ensured sustainability of the project effects.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

<Recommendations to the Department of Primary Education (DPE)>

The O&M costs have turned out to be higher than initially estimated due to the increase in the number of school children. Therefore DPE is expected to cover the shortfall as well as monitor O&M of the facilities on a regular basis.

At the same time, in order to tackle the issue, the increase in the number of teachers in the short run and that of schools in the long run, should be taken into consideration.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance to Development Plans of Bangladesh

The Project was adopted and executed under the "Multipurpose Cyclone Shelter Programme" developed by the Bangladesh Government in 1993. The 5th Five-Year Plan (1997-2002) and the Interim Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (I-PRSP) of 2003 both identified disaster management as one of the priority issues and recognized the need for development of social infrastructure such as cyclone shelters in high-risk areas. The construction of multipurpose shelters as a disaster management means continues to be given a priority as shown in the 2009 National Strategy for Accelerated Poverty Reduction II. It also serves to the improvement of primary education, which was and is still a focus issue in the above development plans of the Bangladesh Government.

(2) Relevance to the Development Needs of Bangladesh

Some 90% of the national land of Bangladesh lies in a delta, which leaves the country prone to natural disasters such as cyclones. However, 25 % of the population lives in 19 coastal districts particularly vulnerable to cyclone damage, and more damage caused by floods due to the effects of climate change is expected in the future. Measures to reduce disaster damage are high in demand. At the same time, the construction of schools with good facilities, which contributes to improvement of the educational environment, also serves the country's efforts to enhance primary education.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

Disaster control is one of the four priority areas in Japan's Country Assistance Program for Bangladesh developed in March 2003. The Program also aims to improve the educational environment with the main emphasis placed on improvement of basic education. Disaster control was also given special attention in light of Japan's human security policy on ODA since the poor are greatly affected by natural disasters.

This project has been highly relevant with the country's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high.

2 Efficiency

(1) Project Outputs

The construction of 20 multipurpose shelters and the procurement of auxiliary facilities were executed as planned. The whole facility is being used effectively and properly. The Project implementation was efficient as can be seen for example in the selection of an arsenic filter unit that is less expensive and easy to maintain, after examining 9 different types of units.

(2) Project Period (Project Inputs)

There were delays in land acquisition, removal of deteriorated school buildings and construction of access roads to the shelters, all of which were supposed to be undertaken by the Bangladeshi Government before the start of shelter construction. The delays however did not affect the construction schedule and the actual Project duration was 20 months, which turned out exactly as planned.

(3) Project Cost (Project Inputs)

The total cost of the Project was 634.7 million yen, which is lower than planned (98.4% of the estimated cost of 645 million yen).

Both project period and project cost were mostly as planned; therefore, efficiency of the project is high.

3 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Quantitative Effects

Expected effects of the Project have been observed. 20 cyclone shelters constructed under the Project accommodated 38,655 people, more than the originally assumed number of 37,156, when Cyclone SIDR struck the country in 2007. That contributed to helping the country to minimize possible damage. The effectiveness of the Project in terms of improving the educational environment was also high. The target number of 41 pupils per classroom was achieved at the time of the Project completion. It was reported that a safe environment at the schools for pupils as well as teachers was secured with a reduced level of congestion in classrooms and improvement of such facilities as toilets, water supply facilities and blackboards. However, it was observed at the time of the ex-post evaluation that congestion in classrooms at some of the schools deteriorated by 150 to 200%, which is attributable to the population growth, the government's policy to encourage school enrollment, and the fact that the constructed schools with better facilities than other schools have attracted more pupils. The government has taken some measures to reduce the congestion, such as the use of old classrooms and the introduction of a double shift system at schools. Though it has not had a serious impact on the achievement of the project objective, it has been reported that the increase in water consumption and the shortage of teachers have had some negative consequences, and therefore there is a concern that those issues could hamper the sustained improvement of the educational environment.

(2) Impacts (Impacts on the natural environment, Land Acquisition and Resettlement, and Unintended Positive/Negative Impacts)

The constructed shelters have been used for such occasions as meetings, weddings and funerals, thereby contributing to promotion of community activities.

The constructed shelters have fulfilled a role to save lives and contributed to improving the educational environment, while they have produced an indirect effect of promoting community activities. Taking these into consideration, this project has somewhat achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is fair.

4 Sustainability

(1) Structural Aspects of Operation Maintenance

The routine maintenance of the buildings and auxiliary facilities such as toilets, wells, desks and blackboards are taken care of by the School Management Committee (SMC) and overseen by the DPE at the Upazila level. The arrangements for maintenance have been made as assumed in the plan and the division of responsibilities among those concerned is clear. There is no change in the operational arrangements at a time of disaster too, assuming the Disaster Management Committee at the Upazila level procure food and medicines. There is an established system of information distribution on evacuation, with volunteers to pass on warnings in place.

(2) Technical Aspects of Operation Maintenance

There are no technical difficulties on the side of schools as well as the SMC with routine O&M. The School is supposed to make a request to the LGED through the SMC when highly technical repairs are required. LGED has skills and profound experience in the construction and rehabilitation of multipurpose cyclone shelters, including those shelters built under Phases I to IV of this Project.

(3) Financial Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Small maintenance expenses have been covered by the maintenance budget of each school, which is distributed by the DPE. The SMC has managed to pay shortfalls, if any, out of resources collected from or donated by residents, and therefore there have been no serious problems to cover maintenance expenses. Though LGED has not yet made an initially planned budget allocation for routine maintenance to each school, it has secured the budget for regular monitoring of shelters and painting of exterior walls. In the case of extensive rehabilitation, which is not required yet, it is assumed that the LGED will execute it with DPE's finance.

(4) Current Status of Operation Maintenance

The buildings and auxiliary facilities had been well-maintained when the ex-post evaluation was carried out. It was confirmed that there was improvement with issues of improper use of toilets and administration of keys, both of which had been pointed out in the study conducted after the Project completion.

No major problems have been observed in the operation and maintenance system; therefore, sustainability of the project effect is high.