

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Nobuko Fujita Foundation for Advanced Studies on International Development	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Construction of Fisheries Center	January 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Antigua and Barbuda	
Project Period	March 2004-January 2006	
Implementing Agency	The Fisheries Division, Ministry of Agriculture, Lands, and Marine Resources	
Project Cost	Grant Limit: 921 million yen	Actual Grant Amount: 917 million yen
Main Contractors	Construction and Procurement: Toa Construction Company	
Main Consultants	Ecoh Corporation and Kyokuyo Co., Ltd.	
Basic Design	Basic Design Study: June 25, 2003-March 31, 2004	
Related Projects (if any)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. JICA, Expert in fisheries development (1997) 2. JICA, Expert in fisheries development (March 2002-March 2004) 3. JICA, Expert in fisheries development and distribution (August-December 2006, June2007-November 2008) 4. JICA, Expert in fisheries development and distribution (January 2010 – January 2012) 5. Grant, the project for construction of fish landing and distributing facilities in St. John's in Antigua and Barbuda (1,280million yen, 1997) 6. Grant, the Project for Rehabilitation of Artisanal Fishery, Parham (857million yen, 2000) 7. Grant, the Project for Rehabilitation of Artisanal Fishery, Urlings (798million yen, 2001) 8. Grant, The Project for Construction of Artisanal Fisheries Facilities in Barbuda (1,328million yen 2009) 9. Canada (Organizational strengthening of fisheries administration, construction of Codrington Fisheries Center, etc.) 10. Technical assistance from CARICOM (Caribbean Community), OECS (Organization of Eastern Caribbean States), FAO (Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations) 	
Project Background	<p>Antigua and Barbuda, with a population of 85,000 (2006), has a monoculture economy dependent on tourism. The country places fishing industry as an industry with high potential for growth and with the goal of sustainable use of its marine resources by exercising appropriate development and management while providing a stable domestic fish supply to substitute imports and as exports to earn foreign currency.</p> <p>Given the above context, Antigua and Barbuda planned to construct a fisheries center at Point Wharf which is the country's largest fishing port, and called on Japan for grant aid cooperation. The center (fishing complex) includes landing facilities, a processing plant and hygienic laboratory with internationally recognized sanitation standards, thereby strengthening the landing capability for marine products including those from Barbuda island, and supplying the market with sanitary and safe, value-added marine products.</p>	
Project Objective	To construct landing and processing facilities for fishery products at Point Wharf landing site in order to supply hygienically and safely processed seafood to the market.	
Output[s] (Japanese Side)	<p>-Wharfs, revetment, slipway, an administration office building with a hygienic laboratory and a meeting hall, a processing plant, a work shop and fishing gear lockers and a boat yard are constructed.</p> <p>-Equipment for the hygienic laboratories, processing plant, and meeting hall were procured and installed.</p>	

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

This project constructed a fisheries complex at Point Wharf landing site, which is located in St. John's, the capital of Antigua and Barbuda. In phase I, an unloading wharf, revetments, and a slipway (*1), which were dilapidated and damaged by hurricanes were repaired, and in phase II, an administrative office building with hygienic laboratory (*2), a meeting hall and an office for the Fisheries Division, a processing plant, a workshop (for engine repair), fishing gear lockers and boatyard were constructed and equipment for the hygienic laboratory, processing plant, and meeting hall were provided.

Although the fisheries complex had some difficulties, the contractor and the Fisheries Division repaired it. Today the wharf, slipway, boatyard, lockers, meeting hall and administration office are effectively utilized. On the other hand, the processing plant has not reached the pre-set target and hygienic laboratory has not yet started full-fledged operation. The Project goal "to provide sanitary and safe, value-added products to the market" has come within reach. However, more time will be necessary for it to be accredited as a processing plant/hygienic laboratory based on internationally recognized sanitation standards. Currently, another grant project "The Project for Construction of Artisanal Fisheries Facilities in Barbuda" to construct a similar fisheries complex in Barbuda is underway. Once it is completed, it is planned that the catch brought in from Barbuda island will increase the landing of fish at Point Wharf, and this will make the processing plant full operational. In order to ensure the development effectiveness, a JICA expert to the Fisheries Division is dispatched.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be fairly satisfactory.

(*1) a tilted way to pull up boats

(*2) Sensory evaluation (color, odor, parasites), physical inspection (length, weight, contamination), chemical inspection (histamine, moisture content, etc.), and bacteriological analysis were planned to be conducted.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance to the Development Plan of Antigua and Barbuda

Manifesto 2004, which is the outline of the National Development Plan of Antigua and Barbuda states that diversification of industries is central to economic development. It emphasizes fisheries as an important industry utilizing the nation's natural resources, thereby, promoting self-reliance. In addition, the Fisheries Development Plan (2010) stresses the production of high quality marine products, and the preparation of a sanitary environment for landing and distribution facilities.

(2) Relevance to the Development Needs of Antigua and Barbuda

An important objective for Antigua and Barbuda is developing a fishing industry utilizing the nation's own resources. With the shift to a Caribbean Single Market Economy, improving marine product quality to increase competitiveness is becoming increasingly acute. Furthermore, in order to export marine products to EU countries (the French Caribbean islands: Martinique, Guadalupe, etc.), EU sanitation and quality requirements need to be met. This has been challenging.

(3) Relevance to Japan's ODA Policy

In the "New Framework for Cooperation between Japan-CARICOM in 21st Century", approved at the ministerial meeting between Japan and CARICOM in 2000, seven important cooperation sectors were defined. These include tourism, fisheries, and agriculture.

From the above, this project has been highly relevant to the country's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore its relevance is high.

2 Efficiency

(1) Project Outputs

The wharfs, revetments, slipway, administrative office building with hygienic laboratory, meeting hall, office for the Fisheries Division, processing plant, workshop, fishing gear lockers and boatyard were constructed and equipment for hygienic laboratory (high speed refrigerated centrifuge, Soxhlet fat extractor, water activity measuring unit, Kjeldhal digester and auto titration unit, etc.), processing plant (smoke chamber, belt conveyer, vacuum packing machine, etc.) and meeting hall (projector, etc.) were provided. However, it was reported that various types of repair work were needed after that. In addition to some repair work following "the inspection of one year after completion of the project," major repair work was also carried out in 2008 and 2009. Even in 2010, there was leakage from the rain as well as the water from the refrigerant pipe of the air conditioner breaking out. The contractor and the Fisheries Division have conducted a number of repairs to this date.

(2) Project Period (Project Inputs)

Including detailed designing and tendering periods, the Project was completed as planned in 22 months (equal to 100% of planned period).

(3) Project Cost (Project Inputs)

The Project spent 917 million yen against the project budget of 921 million yen (equal to 99.6% of planned cost) during the project period.

From the above, although both project period and project cost were within the plan, there were some problems concerning quality of the outputs. Therefore, efficiency of the Project is fair.

3 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Quantitative Effects

The target number of registered fisher folk in Point Wharf was 190 in 2007 as compared to 127 in 2003. As of 2010, there are 147, which is below the target. Although, since some of the boats registered at other three landing points in St. John's Bay use Point Wharf processing plant, actual user may exceed 147. The processed product target at the newly built processing plant was 55t in 2007. It is now 6.75~9t; however the tonnage is trending higher. Although the sample target at the hygienic laboratory was 70 in 2007, it is still in the stage of preparing for operation.

The reason for this is that the Project, as originally planned, expected that the catch from Barbuda would also be landed at Point Wharf. Since the project to construct a fisheries complex in Barbuda is underway as mentioned above, the catch landed at Point Wharf is now mostly sold at foreshore. Therefore the need for processing is low. Because of this, only preliminary processing (scaling, degutting, filet, slice, and packing) is done while other processing methods including freezing (30%), smoking (5%), and salting (5%) were initially planned. (The rest of the 60% was planned as preliminary processing.) As mentioned before, once the fisheries complex in Barbuda is completed, fish caught by Barbuda boats can be stored with ice, making it possible for this catch to be brought into Point Wharf for processing. (11t is expected.)

(2) Impacts (Impacts on the natural environment, Land Acquisition and Resettlement, Unintended Positive/Negative Impact)

Wharfs, slipway, locker rooms, workshop, and ice provided at the complex, made the fisher folks' work and maintenance of the boats easier, which contributed to improving their working environment. Processed products are exported or sold to restaurants and hotels in the city.

Moreover, since the Fisheries Division moved into the administration building, and the meeting room was provided, the registration of the boats and consultations between the fishermen and the Fisheries Division have become more efficient.

Before the Project, the export of fresh lobster to EU countries was impossible because the EU made the introduction of HACCP (Hazard Analysis and Critical Control Point) obligatory. By being packed at the Point Wharf processing plant, export of live lobster and live fish were temporarily permitted. However, the plant still does not meet the EU standard since the EU has pointed out several issues to be addressed in order to meet its standard. For example, the processing plant needs to be surrounded by a fence in order to keep a sanitary environment.

As positive indirect impact, beautification of Point Wharf area was pointed out. It used to be an area covered with old buildings, shrubs and uncontrolled vegetation. The Project gave the area more pleasing and aesthetic appearance by not only constructing buildings and facilities, but developing surrounding area as a whole. The trash thrown in the area and sea by locals and fisher folk has been reduced, the local scenery has been substantially improved.

There was no land acquisition and impact on natural environment. The sewage water from the processing plant and administrative building is properly treated.

From the above, this project has somewhat achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is fair.

4 Sustainability

(1) Structural Aspects of Operation Maintenance

During the planning, Antigua Fisheries Limited was supposed to manage the complex. However, after a change of administration, the Fisheries Division itself is now in charge of its management. A fisheries complex coordinator, who manages the entire fisheries complex in the country (including, Parham, Urlings, Point Wharf) was assigned at the Division. Currently, the Fisheries Division has assigned 7 staff members to the Point Wharf fishing complex. The Hygienic plant was initially planned to be utilized by the concerned division of the Ministry of Agriculture. However, since three years have passed without delivering results, the Fisheries Division is now in charge of operating it. One Cuban animal doctor has been appointed since 2010 and has started preparing to begin operation.

(2) Technical Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Some of the equipment is not being used at this moment. In addition to equipment for the hygienic laboratory, a smoke chamber, belt conveyer, and blast freezer, among others in the processing plant are not in use. Currently the Fisheries Division is preparing an independent smoking chamber room on its own, since the smoke chamber should have been placed outside of the processing room, so that dirt and germs are not brought in with logs and smoke does not cause hygienic problem for strictly sanitation-controlled processing room. A conveyer belt whose need has not been identified is also not yet utilized. The blast freezer is not used since there is not enough fish for freezing at the moment. One of the processing plant staff has received training from JICA, and a JICA expert (2010-2012) at the Fisheries Division has been providing technical assistance.

(3) Financial Aspects of Operation Maintenance

The Fisheries Division budget has been increasing every year since 2005, and the Point Wharf fisheries complex has been receiving own budget since 2009. However, once full-scale hygienic examination starts operation, the financial aspects of maintenance, for example, whether or not chemicals are adequately supplied, remains to be seen.

(4) Current Status of Operation Maintenance

The administrative office building except the hygienic laboratory, the wharfs, slipway, boat yard and lockers, processing plant, and some of the equipment for processing is utilized and maintenance and operation difficulties are properly dealt with. The boat engine repair space is effectively utilized during the daytime, although the fisher folk cannot leave the engines and materials over night since it is an open air. Since most of the equipment is Japanese, some of it is not easy to repair or procure, for example, air conditioners or small spare parts such as switches. Currently, a long-term expert to the Fisheries Division offers support in procuring spare parts and in replacing some of the equipment with ones that are more accessible to after sale services. The Fisheries Division is making efforts in sustainable utilisation of the facilities.

Some problems have been observed in structural aspects and current status of operation maintenance; therefore sustainability of the project effect is fair.