

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

| | | |
|---------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------|
| Evaluator, Affiliation | Miho Kawahatsu Waseda Research Institute Corporation (WRI) | Duration of Evaluation Study |
| Project Name | The Project for Construction of the Cambodia-Japan Cooperation Center in the Kingdom of Cambodia | January 2010 – December 2010 |

I Project Outline

| | | |
|------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| Country Name | The Kingdom of Cambodia | |
| Project Period | June 2004-November 2005 | |
| Executing Agency | The Royal Phnom Penh University, The Cambodia-Japan Cooperation Center (CJCC) | |
| Project Cost | Grant Limit: 490 million yen | Actual Grant Amount: 489 million yen |
| Main Contractors | Konoike Construction Co., Ltd. | |
| Main Consultants | Pacific Consultants International | |
| Basic Design | May 2004 | |
| Related Projects (if any) | JICA, “The project for Cambodia-Japan Cooperation Center” (phase I: 2004-2009, phase II: 2009-) (Technical Cooperation Project) | |
| Project Background | <p>The 1991 Paris Conference notably added emphasis to the importance of democratization and globalization as challenges to the development of Cambodia. Cambodia has needed to leave behind its negative legacy and re-establish itself as a democratic country with objectives including, in particular, economic growth and poverty reduction, through the processes of a free market-oriented policy. The Government of Cambodia requested assistance in the form of Japanese Grant Aid for to establish a facility as the Cambodia-Japan Cooperation Center (CJCC), to promote human resource development for adjusting to the ever-changing global market economy as well as cultivation of mutual understanding between Cambodia and Japan and other nations.</p> | |
| Project Objective | To construct facilities and install equipment, in order to implement “Human Resource Development Courses,” “Japanese Language Courses” and “Exchange Programs” at the CJCC. | |
| Output[s] (Japanese Side) | <p>1. Facilities (1) Seminar Rooms Computer Room, Japanese Style Room, Reception Room, Instruction Room, etc. (2) Multi-Purpose Hall, Pantry, Corridor, Toilets, Machinery Space, Storage Space, etc</p> <p>2. Provision of equipment Lobby Display, Library Control Desk, CCTV system, AV Equipment, Room Furniture, Telecommunication systems, etc.</p> | |

II Result of the Evaluation

| |
|---------------------------|
| Summary of the evaluation |
|---------------------------|

This project is judged highly relevant in terms of policies and needs, and promising with respect to human resources development (HRD). Further, to the extent enabled by evaluating the number of graduates of the HRD course and the Japanese language course, as two indicators determined at the time of project planning as measures of effectiveness, the degree of attainment of targets is high, and the facilities are being used for the purposes of contributing to exchange between Cambodia and Japan. However, lowering of the efficiency has resulted from a delay of the project period and start of courses.

Moreover, from the viewpoint of sustainability, although some progress has been made toward independent management, it has been unavoidable for a while to depend on Japanese financial support. It was reported that in terms of both technical and financial matters it has been difficult to operate and maintain the facilities. There also is concern that physical sustenance of the facilities may be difficult, as in three years following the completion, measures have become necessary for formaldehyde and termites. Therefore, it is desirable to make a follow-up study of ways to minimize the financial burden on Cambodia so as to ensure sustained functioning of the facilities.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be fairly satisfactory.

<Recommendations>

As recommendations to the executing agency, mention must be made of issues related to financial aspects, to ensure sustainability of operation and maintenance. From the viewpoint of strengthening the financial base, it is deemed to be indispensable to secure an independent source of funding and to make good, proactive use of Cambodians as instructors and lecturers. In order to increase the number of students and seminar participants of the CJCC for years to come, what is required is strategic investment as well as a management plan for utilization of existing knowledge and human resources of the Royal University of Phnom Penh. Further, considering the future prospects for regional integration, it would be beneficial to make the most of the TV conference system in order to actively share valuable lessons and experiences of the CJCC with the other Japan Centers in Mekong countries.

<Constraints of this evaluation study>

Because this was a project involving construction of entirely new facilities in conjunction with technical assistance in the form of the dispatch of instructors from Japan, at the present time the project cannot be continued without technical cooperation by Japan. Independent management of the project including operation and maintenance at this time cannot be done by Cambodians alone, and it is thought that some time will be needed before the sustainability of the project can be ensured.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Cambodia

At the time of project planning, the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport announced its Strategic Program for Education and on the basis of the program, the Education Sector Support Program (ESSP) including priority planning for 2001~2005 was formulated, with the objective of improving the quality of education and including the specific targets of “promoting participation by the private sector,” and supplying secondary education of immediate value in the job market.” The plan for this project was prepared to conform to this policy.

At the time of the ex-post evaluation, the importance of HRD and secondary education within the National Strategic Development Plan: 2006~2010 is being given special attention. In the second ESSP (2006~2010) mention is made of improvement of access to vocational education and secondary education, “augmentation of educational materials, school facilities and school equipment,” “strengthening education administration work by means of training of officials and monitoring. The ESSP also included a Priority Action Program (PAP) that is concerned with broad issues in the education sector. Thus, this project is consistent with development programs of Cambodia.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Cambodia

At the time of project planning, it was recognized that it was important in view of the country’s target of functioning as a market economy, as well as economic globalization, participation in ASEAN, to improve the training and education of internationally oriented persons having specialized knowledge and technical abilities. In particular, although even at that time, it was possible to study general business subjects at the management courses at the 13 colleges under the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport, the management programs do not meet the needs of the expanding, diversifying business and industry. Also, at the Royal University of Phnom Penh, prior to this project, volunteers were assisting in Japanese language courses, complying with the student desires for learning Japanese.

At the time of the ex-post evaluation, needs to learn business management are still high. After 2006, however, there has been rapid improvement of the legal basis for the general business environment,* and at some universities, specialization at advanced levels became possible. Concerning Japanese language requirements, regular courses have continued and demand for Japanese language education remains high. Therefore, at both the time of planning and of the ex-post evaluation, the project matched development needs of the nation.

* Cambodia Development Council, “Cambodia Investment Guidebook,” Jan. 2010.

(3) Relevance with Japan’s ODA Policy

At the time of project planning, the policy of Japan’s development assistance program for Cambodia was to utilize special qualities associated with Japan to develop human resources capable of dealing with the shift to a market economy as was deemed essential for sustained stabilization of the nation in the course of advancement of peace in the Asia-Pacific region. According to JICA policy for project implementation in Cambodia, in addition, within “development of the economy and industry,” development of the private sector was assigned importance and in accordance with that it was sought to development human resources so as to provide through projects the special capabilities and skills needed for the promotion of the economy and industry. Moreover it was desired to maintain a close relationship of the two countries and to promote economic exchanges between them. By means of its HRD courses and Japanese language courses, as well as the promotion of exchanges, this project was consistent with Japanese policy.

This project has been highly relevant with Cambodia’s development plan, development needs, as well as Japan’s ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high.

2 Efficiency

(1) Project Outputs

There were changes regarding project outputs as follows;

At the time of basic design of the project, there was a change in the location of earthquake-resistant walls, change in the flooring materials to be used (from vitreous tile to tile carpet), change in the number of GRC louvers, addition of one ceiling-mounted cassette type air conditioner, modification of lighting in the multi-purpose hall, addition to two places for infiltration tank protection from rain water, change in the size of septic tank. These resulted in a change in administration overhead.

At the time of the detailed design the height of part of the fence on the west side of the interior court was changed, the finishing materials for the multi-purpose hall were changed, and there was a change in the finishing work for the ceiling of storage at the second floor.

(2) Project Period (Project Inputs)

The project required 18 months, through November 2005, whereas the plan period was 17 months, from June 2004 (E/N) to October 2005. The actual period was slightly longer than planned (106%).

(3) Project Cost (Project Inputs)

Initial project cost was planned at 490 million yen but actual cost was 489 million yen. So the project was completed as planned (99.8%).

Although the project period was longer than planned, the project cost was mostly as planned, therefore efficiency of the project is fair.

3 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Quantitative Effects

At the time of project planning, the anticipated target number was expected to reflect the respective number of students who had completed an HRD course and had attended seminars at the CJCC, and that by the end of the target year of 2009 a total of 5,000 would have participated. Data from the executing agency, however, indicates only the number of persons who have completed the HRD course, and it was not possible to obtain data on seminar participants, for which reason recourse was made to referring to the number of participants finishing courses in 2008. As a result, in 2009 1,819 persons completed the HRD course. In addition, when evaluation of related technical cooperation was carried out in 2008, it was reported that the participants in seminars came to 5,578, for a total of 7,397. Consequently, we can conclude that the 2009 target of above 5,000 has been reached.

Also, the cumulative number of Japanese language students projected at the time of project planning was 700 or more, but in 2009 there were 1,150, meaning that the target was achieved.

On the basis of data provided to use tabulating the rates of usage of different facilities we calculated the annual usage rate of seminar rooms (5 of them), meeting rooms (two) and the multi-purpose hall. Taken together, the seminar rooms were heavily used; the rate of usage was stable at about 80%. Regarding the multi-purpose hall, usage was low in the early years (2005, 27%; 2006, 48%) but rose over time and is now at a satisfactory level (2008, 66%; 2009, 81%).

(2) Impacts (Impacts on the Natural Environment, Land Acquisition and Resettlement, Unintended Positive/Negative Impact)

The response obtained from the executing agency indicates that the project facilities are contributing to educational activities and cultural exchange, by being used for a study-in-Japan fair, a fashion show featuring traditional ethnic clothing of the two countries, concerts, displays of robots, a Japanese drum concert, Japanese seasonal 'bon odori' dance festival, scientific exhibitions, so it was confirmed that the facilities are serving their intended purpose. Further, as to whether the facilities were playing a role in support of Japanese language education and HRD for business persons, among those who have studied Japanese several have gone to Japan as exchange students or found employment in Japanese companies, and among the HRD graduates in 2008 we are informed that of 2008 graduates 22% of opened their own business.

In addition to this, the facilities are used by the government and international agencies, business organizations, colleges, NGOs and others as a venue for exchange of information.

Further, as for the role of facilitating communication and exchange of information with other countries in the Asian region, and interaction with other Japan Centers for the purpose of HRD, there is one case in point, namely that students in the HRD course visited Japan Center in Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam. Further, the Tokyo Declaration of the First Meeting between the Heads of the Governments of Japan and the Mekong region countries in 2009, endorsed common training courses for CLV countries by utilizing the existing TV conference system. On the whole indirect effects of the project are being developed.

It has been informed to us that there have been no other issues reported concerning the environment, relocation of inhabitants, or land acquisition.

This project has largely achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Structural Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Arrangements for this project have undergone no change since the plan was made; the agency with oversight for the project facilities is the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport. The CJCC management is the responsibility of the Royal University of Phnom Penh. Continued support is being provided by the government, the president of the university, and executives of the university. It was also reported that there was awareness that the project facilities and equipment were contributing the earnings of the university.

(2) Technical Aspects of Operation Maintenance

There are issues related to the management, and operation and maintenance, of the facilities and supplied equipment, and according to the CJCC, it is difficult to find appropriate technicians and when spare parts are needed they cannot be obtained domestically.

(3) Financial Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Regarding the budget for O&M, the Royal University of Phnom Penh provides part of its budget allocation from the government to defray some of the CJCC personnel costs and expenses of O&M (electricity, water, etc.). The CJCC obtains income from tuition paid for HRD and Japanese language courses; rental of facilities & equipment; and membership fee, etc. And the CJCC pays for expenses such as honorariums, trash removal, disinfection, gardening, entertainment etc. Regarding the lecture fee income, the income is to be obtained in the form of fees paid by persons attending lectures in courses offered by Japanese consultants assigned by a JICA technical cooperation project.

Expenses for activities (staff costs, overtime, telecommunications, travel, etc.) necessary for operations are paid out of JICA funds and are not covered by budget money from Cambodian side. Thus, as the bulk of expenses for O&M is being covered by funds from JICA, the Cambodian side provides only 19% of a total cost in 2007. According to JICA, the latest ratio of CJCC's own income to total operational expenses has risen (to 22% in 2008, 34% in 2009). It is still hardly said to be sufficient but it suggests a trend toward improvement in financial strength. It is advisable to accelerate the transfer of knowledge and expertise as much as possible to potential Cambodians who may serve as instructors by using a bigger part of lecture fee income for compensation. By such a substitution, it will be possible to ensure financial sustainability. According to JICA, the actual number of local instructors is 4 out of 46 in 2008, and 9 out of 40 in 2009.

(4) Current Status of Operation Maintenance

Further, in 2008, after the defects liability period, there was an odor suggestive of formaldehyde and there were complaints by users of the facilities that they did not feel well after being inside for a long period of time and expressions of worry over becoming ill. Also, at the end of 2009, termites were discovered and the need for treatment by an exterminator was confirmed. According to JICA, formaldehyde treatment and termite extermination was properly done and termite treatment is ongoing. After the proofing, an expansion work of seminar rooms is planned as a follow-up project.

Major problems have been observed in terms of financial aspects, therefore sustainability of the project effects is low.