

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Yukiko Sueyoshi Global Link Management, Inc.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Improvement of Domasi College of Education	March 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Republic of Malawi	
Project Period	July 2004 (Detail Study)-January 2006 (Completion date/ Handover date)	
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MoEST), Division of education planning	
Project Cost	Grant Limit: 568 million yen	Actual Grant Amount: 567 million yen
Main Contractors	Shimizu Corporation	
Main Consultants	Kume Sekkei Co., Ltd	
Basic Design	“Basic design study report on the project for secondary school teacher training facility improvement at Domasi College of Education in the Republic of Malawi“, Kume Sekkei Co., Ltd., 2003	
Related Projects (if any)	JICA, Strengthening of Mathematics and Science in Secondary Education (SMASSE) INSET (In-Service Training) Malawi (2004-2007) JICA, Strengthening of Mathematics and Science in Secondary Education (SMASSE) INSET Malawi Phase II (2008-1012)	
Project Background	<p>Since the government of Malawi had been emphasized higher education since the independence, the dissemination of primary and secondary education was lagged behind. In 1993, the Education for all (EFA) strategy was introduced, together with the introduction of free primary education in order to improve such situation. As a result, the number of students enrolled in secondary education was rapidly increased. In response to the sharply increasing demand for secondary education, MoEST has redeployed primary school teachers with two years training to secondary schools teachers. Under this circumstance, because of a high proportion of low-qualified secondary school teachers with a training background involving only primary education teaching method, many secondary schools found it almost impossible to organize lessons based on the official curriculum of secondary education. Therefore, a qualitative improvement of secondary education and training of qualified teachers which were capable of teaching the contents of the new curriculum in a competent manner was urged.</p>	
Project Objective	To construct new educational facilities and provide necessary equipment in order to improve the quality of secondary education in Domasi College of Education.	
Output[s] (Japanese Side)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -construction of demonstration school for secondary education and teachers hostel, and provision of relevant equipment -construction of female hostel and provision of relevant equipment -construction of computer laboratory and provision of relevant equipment -construction of gymnasium and provision of relevant equipment 	

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>This project has been highly relevant with the country’s development policy and development needs, as well as Japan’s ODA policy; therefore, its relevance is high. The planned objectives of the project have been almost achieved, and positive impacts were reported so far, therefore its effectiveness is also high. Although the project period was slightly longer than planned, the reason of delay was unavoidable because of delay in custom procedures for some materials; therefore the efficiency of the project is high. No major problems have been observed in the operation and maintenance structure, technical and finance aspects. Furthermore, after the project completion, JICA has been providing continual technical cooperation projects in order to improve the quality of secondary education in Malawi, and the Domasi College of Education has been played a role as a national training center, so sustainability of the project’s effect is also high. In light of the above, this project is evaluated as highly satisfactory.</p> <p><Recommendations></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The craft room and relevant materials were not utilized as originally planned at the time of ex-post evaluation because a craft teacher has not been allocated in the demonstration school for secondary education. It is recommended that the Domasi College of Education prioritize to recruit a craft teacher in the future. <p><Constraints of this evaluation study></p> <p>This evaluation is a simplified version without a field survey; therefore, the evaluation was performed under some constraints as follows.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) It does not include data that could be confirmed by direct observation, since the evaluation was based solely on data obtained through document review, questionnaires given to the implementing agency and Japanese consultant. 2) When using data on indicators in the questionnaire responses, we requested the raw data as evidence, but were not able to obtain it. 3) Due to the lack of a field survey, there was no opportunity to hold discussions with the executing agency regarding the recommendations.

1 Relevance
<p>(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Malawi At the time of planning, the Policy Investment Framework (2002) identified the priority areas in the education sector such as construction of secondary schools, expansion of educational facilities, improve of curriculum, and training for un-qualified teachers. At the time of ex-post evaluation, the National Education Sector Plan (2008-2017) also affirmed increase in the educational facilities and qualified teachers as one of top priority issue in order to improve the access to the secondary education. Therefore, this project was relevant with the development plan of Malawi from the planning to the end of the project.</p> <p>(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Malawi At the time of planning, there were development needs in improvement of educational system in terms of facility, material and teacher because the number of children enrolled in primary education had sharply increased in Malawi. At the same time, the secondary education in Domasi College of Education which is responsible for training secondary school teachers in Malawi had faced lack of teachers and basic educational facilities and materials. At the time of ex-post evaluation, the same issue has been remained in the educational sector in Malawi. Thus, this project is consistent with Malawi's development needs both when it was planned and the ex-post evaluation was conducted.</p> <p>(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy In February 1997, both governments agreed following two priority areas for Japan's ODA policy for Malawi which were 1) rural development through improvement of productivity in the agricultural sector and 2) basic human needs to reduce poverty reduction (increase in food production, education, environmental conservation, and health and medical service). This project was implemented under the second priority areas, therefore, it was relevant with the Japan's ODA policy.</p> <p>This project has been highly relevant with the country's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high.</p>
2 Efficiency
<p>(1) Project Outputs Japanese outputs were generally achieved as the planned. Under the Project, educational facilities (demonstration school for secondary education, teachers' hostels, female hostel, computer laboratory, and gymnasium) were constructed and relevant educational equipment (science, biology, home economic and craft) were provided to improve the quality of the secondary education in Domasi College of Education.</p> <p>(2) Project Period (Project Inputs) The planned project period was 17.5 months, and actual period was 19 months which was slightly longer than planned (118% of the planned period). The reason for this delay—import clearance procedures from the South African company that required much more time than expected—was unavoidable.</p> <p>(3) Project Cost (Project Inputs) The Japanese grant ceiling amount was 568 million yen, and disbursement was 567 million yen (99.8% of the planned cost); therefore, the project cost was almost as planned.</p> <p>Although the project period was slightly longer than planned, this was due to a delay in the customs procedure for some materials, and project costs were within the plan. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is high.</p>
3 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Quantitative Effects

At the time of planning, the following indicators were set in order to verify the project effectiveness. 'Indicator 1: Number of qualified teachers of secondary education who can conduct classes based on the new curriculum' was 452 person /year in 2007 (94% of the planned target) which was slightly below the target set for 2007 (480 person/year), however, it climbed to 487 person/ year in 2009. 'Indicator 2: Number of qualified female teachers of secondary education who can conduct classes based on the new curriculum' was 270 person/ year in 2007 (112% of the planned target) which exceeded the target set for 2007 (240 person /year). In regard gender disparity, the percentage of female teachers was increased from 41% in 2003 to 55% in 2009 which shows discrepancy in teachers has been improving. 'Indicator 3: Number of qualified teachers of secondary education who can conduct computer classes' was 220 person /year in 2007 (146% of the planned target) and it was the same in number in 2009 which exceeded the target set for 2007 (150 person/year). 'Indicator 4: Number of qualified teachers of secondary education who can conduct gymnastics classes' was 47 person/year in 2007 (156% of the planned target) and it was the same in number in 2009 which exceeded the target set for 2007 (30 person/year). Therefore, it is confirmed that these indicators set by the ex-ante evaluation are almost achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation.

According to the Domasi College of Education regarding utilization of facilities and equipment provided by the project, almost all facilities and equipment are fully utilized by them. The absorption rate of the female dormitory and the teachers hostel are almost 100% at the time of ex-post evaluation.

At the time of planning, it was pointed out as an external factor that the allocation of sufficient number of teachers was essential factor to secure the project's effectiveness. Accordingly, it is confirmed at the ex-post evaluation that since a craft teacher has not been allocated in the demonstration school for secondary education, the craft room and relevant materials were not utilized in demonstration school as originally planned, the materials are currently utilized in the Domasi College of Education. According to the JICA Malawi office, the Malawi side has been planning to allocate one craft teacher to the demonstration school from another school which has more than one craft teachers within the same education area.

(2) Impacts (Impacts on the natural environment, Land Acquisition and Resettlement, Unintended Positive/Negative Impact)

According to the Domasi College of Education, the cluster-related activities (information sharing among secondary education schools), which was assumed to be an indirect effect of the project, have been enhanced since the educational facilities in the college were expanded by the project. It is also reported that there are unintended positive impacts from the project such as enhancement of internal training in the school, information sharing among teachers within the school, community-based education, Parents and Teachers Association (PTA) and increase of the revenue of the college due to increase of number of students. Accordingly, the number of student has been sharply increased from 492 person in 2002 before the project to 718 person in 2008 and 999 in 2009 after the project completion. The implementation of this project did not have a negative impact on the natural environment, and no problems arose in the land acquisition process.

After the project completion, JICA has been providing technical cooperation with aim to improve the quality of secondary education in Malawi, and the Domasi College of Education has been played an important role as a national training center under these cooperations. This may be one of promoting factor to enhance the project effectiveness.

This project has largely achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Structural Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Both the time of planning and the ex-post evaluation, the provided facilities and equipment have been operated and maintained by the Domasi College of Education with total of 3 staff in charge of maintenance in electricity, facility and cleaning. Thus, no major problems have been identified in the operation and maintenance system. For the school management, although the number of teachers was increased from 41 person at the time of planning to 54 person at the time of ex-post evaluation, there are 80 vacant posts in the college. Allocation of sufficient number of teachers is an issue to be tackled by the Domasi College of Education. According to the questionnaire survey to the Domasi College of Education, the post of craft teacher has been vacant in the demonstration school for secondary education since the project completion. Accordingly, it was reported from JICA that the Malawi side has been planning to allocate one craft teacher to the demonstration school from another school within the same education area.

(2) Technical Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Since 2004, the Domasi College of Education has been responsible for the national training center and the teachers played an important role in the in-service teacher's training under the JICA's technical cooperation 'Strengthening of Mathematics and Science in Secondary Education (SMASSE) INSET' with aim to improve quality of secondary education through establishment of INSET policy in Malawi. Since the facilities and equipment provided under the project were designed in accordance with the existing specifications, a proper operation and maintenance is available by the existing staff to this date. This indicate that the technical sustainability is high both the school management and the operation maintenance aspects.

(3) Financial Aspects of Operation Maintenance

The scope of this project was expansion of the existing facilities and provision of equipment, thus the operation and maintenance cost is able to cover within the current budget frames. The Domasi College of Education has received funding for its current budget from the MoEST as one of the training college under the jurisdiction of the MoEST. Thus, it can be assumed that there are no financial problems which bring serious effects on the school management as long as this financial system will continue.

(4) Current Status of Operation Maintenance

According to the questionnaire survey to the Domasi College of Education, although repaint on a scratched-wall is required in the some facilities, almost all facilities and equipment are well functioned and maintained.

No major problems have been observed in the operation and maintenance system, therefore sustainability of the project effect is high.