

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Junko Miura Global Link Management Inc.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for the improvement of equipment of IFEER (Le projet de remise a niveau de l'Institut de Formation aux Engins et à l'Entretien Routier)"	March 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Kingdom of Morocco	
Project Period	February 2005 (confirmation of the plan, review of the specification, preparation of bidding documents and approval)-February 2006 (Hand-over of equipment)	
Executing Agency	La Direction des Routes et de la Circulation Routière, Ministre de l'Equipe ment e du Transport (DRCR)	
Project Cost	Grant Limit: 382 million yen	Actual Grant Amount: 364 million yen
Main Contractors	Construction: None,	Procurement: Itochu Corporation
Main Consultants	Construction Project Consultants Inc.	
Basic Design	"Basic Study Report for the Project for the Improvement of Institut de Formation aux Engins et à l'Entretien Routier (IFEER) in Morocco", December 2004, Construction Project Consultants Inc.	
Related Projects (if any)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 1991-1992, Grant Aid Assistance "The project for construction of IFEER" (Construction of IFEER and procurement of equipment) 2. 1992-1997, Technical Cooperation Project for IFEER 3. 1999-2003, Group Training Course on Road Maintenance and Construction Equipment (Phase I) 4. 2005-2010, Technical Cooperation/ Group Training Course on Road Maintenance and Construction Equipment in IFEER Phase II (Four trainees learned how to operate the new model equipment in the training in Japan as a part of the technical cooperation project before receiving the new equipment) 5. 2009-2011, Group Training Course on Road Maintenance and Construction Equipment Phase III (An expert provided in-depth training of the new model equipment.) 6. 2010, Follow-up cooperation (Spare-parts for the equipment for road construction was provided.) 	
Project Background	Since 1991, the Government of Japan has provided assistance through grant aid project, technical cooperation and group training courses in order to contribute to the human resource development in road construction and maintenance of Morocco and Francophone Africa. However, as more than ten years passed, the equipment and training content is becoming obsolete.	
Project Objective	To provide training equipment for IFEER in order to improve the training contents.	
Output[s] (Japanese Side)	Road construction equipment, equipment for maintenance/garage, and equipment for civil work laboratory	

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>• This project has been highly relevant with the development plan and development needs of Morocco as well as Japan's ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high. Both project period and project cost were within the plan, therefore efficiency of the project is high. Given that the number of trainees and number of new curriculum achieved those targets, this project has largely achieved its objective, namely improvement of training content, therefore its effectiveness is high. No major problems have been observed in the operation and maintenance system, therefore sustainability of the project effects is high. In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.</p> <p><Recommendations></p> <p>• It is recommended for IFEER to continuously develop new curriculum and update the curriculum and to continuously recruit trainers from both public and private sectors in order to respond to the changing needs of road construction and maintenance.</p> <p><Constraints of this evaluation study></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The evaluation was conducted based solely on the data that could be obtained from a review of the materials and questionnaires given to the implementing organization, O&M agency and the Japanese consultants so it does not include data that could be confirmed through direct observation, i.e. the maintenance conditions; 2. When using indicator data in questionnaire responses, the raw data was not confirmed;

1 Relevance
<p>(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Morocco The DRRCR's basic strategy for road construction and maintenance targeted the followings: 1) preservation of road assets by strengthening road repair and operation and maintenance, 2) road improvement for securing economic and safe transportation responding to the increase in traffic volume, and 3) expansion of rural road network based on the Programme National de Routes Rurales (PNRR). Thus, this project was consistent with Morocco's development policy both at the time of planning and the ex-post evaluation.</p> <p>(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Morocco At the time of planning, there were the following challenges in human resource development in order to implement the above basic strategy, and those remain challenges still at the time of ex-post evaluation. 1) training of staff with high technical skills for road network maintenance, 2) securing personnel for PNRR, 3) re-training for both junior and senior staff in order to response to the new model road construction equipment with automatic controlling device (hereinafter referred to as "new model equipment"), which has been recently used by DRRCR and private sector, 4) assistance to the private road construction companies for technical improvement. Thus, this project is consistent with Morocco's development needs both when it was planned and when the ex-post evaluation was conducted.</p> <p>(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy The priority areas agreed on in the policy consultation between the Government of Morocco and that of Japan in July 1997 were 1) development of agriculture and marine industry; 2) water resource development; 3) improvement of infrastructure; 4) rural development for the reduction of geographical disparities and for poverty reduction; 5) environment; and 6) social development. This project supports the improvement of infrastructure. Therefore, it can be said that this project was consistent with Japan's aid policy for Morocco when the project was planned.</p> <p>This project has been highly relevant with the country's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high.</p>
2 Efficiency
<p>(1) Project Outputs The outputs of the Japanese side were mostly as planned except educational equipment.</p> <p>(2) Project Period (Project Inputs) Both planned and actual project period was 13 months. Thus, the project period was as planned (100% of the planned).</p> <p>(3) Project Cost (Project Inputs) The planned project cost was 382 million yen whereas the actual project cost was 364 million yen. Thus, the project cost was lower than planned (95% of the planned). The difference between the plan and actual is due to the cancelation of the educational equipment.</p> <p>Both project period and project cost were within the plan, therefore efficiency of the project is high.</p>
3 Effectiveness / Impact
<p>(1) Quantitative Effects The actual number of the trainees who completed the courses was 395 persons per year in 2007, achieving the 2007 target of 360 persons per year in 2007 (110% of the target). In 2010, it reached 540 persons per year (150% of the target). The number of the trainees respectively from DRRCR, private sector and Third Country (Francophone Africa) also achieved the target. The actual number of newly developed curriculum was six in 2007, achieving the 2007 target of five. It is eight in 2010. Examples of the new curriculum using equipment provided by this project, which were not planned at the time of project planning, are the ones for equipment management and repairing plan. As there is a problem with cooling device for bulldozer engines, bulldozers are used carefully. None of the equipment was unused or used for other purposes.</p> <p>(2) Impacts (Impacts on the natural environment, Land Acquisition and Resettlement, Unintended Positive/Negative Impact) The implementation of this project did not have a negative impact on the natural environment, and no problems arose in the land acquisition process. No residents were relocated.</p> <p>The following intended indirect effects were observed. 1) Most DRRCR engineers and technicians (210 persons per year) completed training by IFEER, and the number of staff who is capable of operating and maintaining the new equipment was increased. This shows the improvement of skills of DRRCR staff. 2) After the new curriculum was introduced, the required time for repairing new model equipment was shortened, as a result, new model equipment became available for use anytime. 3) A number of ex-trainees have been involved in various projects for the annual road construction plan such as road repairing, snow and sand clearing, connection of road network to remote villages. As a result of the training, the required time for clearing snow and sand was shortened. This shows that the improvement of technical skills through the training contribute to the efficient implementation of the annual road construction plan. There was also unintended indirect effect by this project. Ex-trainees of IFEER, particularly the ones who completed the new curriculum, could obtain positions in civil work companies as operators of heavy equipment, whose demand is very high in the job market.</p> <p>This project has largely achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is high.</p>
4 Sustainability

(1) Structural Aspects of Operation and Maintenance

As planned, the trainers of IFEER conduct operation and maintenance (O&M) of the equipment provided by the project while providing trainees with guidance for O&M. Whereas the number of trainers was 21 at the time of planning, it increased to 26 (4 section chiefs, trainers increased from 13 to 16, training assistants increased from 4 to 6) in 2009. This increase made IFEER being capable of the O&M of the new equipment. All the new trainers were recruited from both public and private sectors as the new curriculum were introduced.

(2) Technical Aspects of Operation and Maintenance

Following the recommendations at the time of planning, four trainers learned how to judge malfunctioning and how to repair before receiving the new equipment in the training in Japan as a part of the Technical Cooperation Project for Road Maintenance and Construction Equipment Phase II. They also received basic training from makers when they received the equipment as a part of this project. Furthermore, they received in-depth training from a Japanese expert as a part of the Group Training Course on Road Maintenance and Construction Equipment Phase III. According to IFEER, the training in Japan and the dispatch of a trainer enabled the trainers and trainees to be capable of basic repairs of the new model equipment. Thus, it can be judged that the IFEER trainers have sufficient skills for O&M of the new model equipment.

(3) Financial Aspects of Operation and Maintenance

IFEER has an independent settlement system, and expenses are covered using revenue solely from training fees. The past few years have posted profit. The increase of fuel cost by the newly provided equipment has been covered by the increase in the revenue from training fees. Whereas the planned increased number of trainees is 60 persons per year, the actual number was 95 persons per year.

(4) Current Status of Operation and Maintenance

In January 2010, spare-parts for road construction equipment (bulldozers, hydraulic shovels, wheel loaders, etc) were provided with the follow-up cooperation of this project. According to IFEER, the O&M status of the equipment is good in general. As there is a problem with cooling device for the engines of bulldozers, bulldozers are used carefully. There is no equipment which requires major repair and which are under repair. Regarding the equipment for road maintenance/garage, trainees conduct daily inspection based on the daily inspection check list under the supervision of trainers as a part of training. They record operating hours, fuel consumption quantity and malfunctioning of the equipment. They also conduct regular maintenance along with the daily inspection record as a part of training.

No major problems have been observed in the operation and maintenance system, therefore sustainability of the project effects is high.