

Human Resource Development

1. Performance Analysis Overview

A general overview of the 17 Japanese ODA loan projects in the Human Development Sector that were subjected to an ex-post evaluation reveals that they achieved satisfactory results.

As a whole, “project relevance” of project in the human resource development sector is high. While as this sector’s projects include many procurement items, there are lots of cases of project plan alteration, contents of the project scope alterations are deemed relevant.

The projects implemented in Republic of Korea received high marks in terms of “effectiveness (project goal achievement)” and “sustainability”. The main feature of Korean projects is that they are related to the development and strengthening of the higher education or designated or special fields. There is a necessity to measure the degree of “project goal realization” based on a large amount of data and also by gaining a wider understanding of the “output utilization.” In order to do so, project design and a data management system for operation and maintenance need to be established.

Below is a summary of an analysis of the performance of the projects targeted for review, by the 5 evaluation criteria.

(1) Relevance

“Consistency with development policies and priority issues” was very high, with all the projects conforming to counterpart countries’ development policies and priority issues. “Project relevance” in light of overall goals and project goal were generally deemed to be relevant. In light of the configuration of project plans, alterations were unavoidable. Thus, it would be advisable to create more flexible project plans based on the premise that plan alterations will occur. There were many evaluation reports that did not contain any reference to the “relevance of project plans at the time of evaluation.”

(2) Efficiency

The degree of completion of outputs was high. All projects were implemented as intended. In contrast, there were many projects that fell behind schedule during implementation. These delays were due to plan alterations and the concomitant delays in the procurement cycle. Most of the project costs remained within the original scope, with 15 of the 17 projects (or 90%) being for the most part within the budget. Although the types and amounts of procured goods vary widely, the volume of goods acquired was subject to adjustments according to the amount of money available.

(3) Effectiveness

There were 8 projects, making up approximately 50% of the total, in which the “output utilization” was considered good. In addition, the evaluations of 4 other projects indicated that utilization was almost as projected. When taken together, 70% of the projects had good utilization conditions. Projects where the state of utilization was good were concentrated in Korea. By combining ‘achieved’ and ‘mostly achieved’, the degree to which “project objectives were achieved” overall was 90%.

As a sample group, 17 projects is not very large. However, projects in the higher education and designated or special fields clearly demonstrated a tendency to achieve a high degree of project results.

(4) Impact

For the most part, “impacts” were not evaluated. This is perhaps due to uncertainty in understanding how to assess overall objectives.

(5) Sustainability

Projects in which “sustainability” received high marks were those in Korea. In addition, the “continuity of needs” was most highly appraised in the Elementary Education Projects (the Philippines, Jordan).



Philippines Elementary Education Project

2 Lessons Learned / Recommendations

(1) Flexible handling in procurement methods (selection of commodities, specifications, and amounts)

In projects in the Human Resource Development Sector, educational equipment and educational facilities (schools, classrooms, bathrooms, laboratories, etc.) are essential. In the future, even if the emphasis shifts to intangibles such as securing the number of faculty, instructors, improving their quality, supporting the creation of educational curricula, and on the job training programs, the equipment and facilities portion of the project must continue to be an integral part of the project. For that reason, it is important to examine here the problems that have surfaced in the evaluation reports regarding projects that focused on the provision of equipment.

Although all of the projects under this review were subjected to plan alterations, the changes were generally considered to be relevant. Project objectives were also regarded as relevant. However, the means by which plan objectives are to be realized is through the project plans (or the project scale in many cases). Judging the relevance of these plans in advance is no easy matter. Given this, projects should be designed on the assumption that project plans will be altered, which will help to ensure that project implementation will go smoothly in the future.

In regard to procurement methods, flexibility is key element. A following idea should be examined; If the implementation agency is highly capable, it should be given further independence and broader authority in procurement of goods, and

after project completion JBIC should examine whether procurement was carried out correctly.

(2) Importance in examining the intangibles during project formation

For projects in the social services sector, in order to ensure that acquired equipment is used effectively and to maintain these results, it is vital that more importance be placed on the intangible elements. This includes securing human resources and achieving higher technological levels, and having the capability to develop utilization programs. Also, critical elements include gaining a full understanding of the present status of these intangibles and their problem areas during appraisal, and investigations into improvements. In terms of indicators that would reveal the status of these types of intangible elements, problem areas, and conditions in the sectors (sub-sectors), the situation should be pre-assessed as much as possible through sector studies and other methods. By doing so, appropriate systems capable of responding to these conditions can be established during appraisal. In addition, problem areas occurring in these intangible elements should be understood during the project formation stage or appraisal. At the same time, if it seems likely that the ODA loan recipient nations or implementation agencies are not capable of resolving the problems, there is a need to consider extending support proactively in order to improve these intangible elements and to strengthen organizations. One way to tackle this under the present scheme could include offering Special Assistance for Project Formation (SAPROF) scheme of JBIC, consulting services, dispatching JICA experts, or accepting trainees in Japan.



Jordan Human Resources Development Sector Investment Project

(3) Configuration of the administration system in regard to equipment utilization and inventory control

There is a need to strengthen the record-keeping system concerning the utilization method, storage and control of equipment provided. This is also tied into the ability to grasp the state of control, or more exactly to measure the implementation capabilities, of the implementation agencies. For the configuration of the utilization, inventory control and other systems should be introduced by the consultant hired by the project, and the implementation agency itself, or as circumstances demand, the application of Special Assistance for Project Implementation (SAPI) should be considered.