

Summary of Ex-post Evaluation Study

Evaluation conducted by: JICA Thailand Office

1. OUTLINE OF THE PROJECT	
Country: Kingdom of Thailand	Project title: Capacity Building on the Development of Information Technology for Education (ITEd)
Issue/Sector: Information and Communication Technology	Cooperation scheme: Technical Cooperation
Division in charge: Social Dev. Dep't, Group 2, ICT Team	Total cost: appr. 511 million Yen
Supporting Organization in Japan: Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology, Ministry of Economy, Trade, and Industry, Naruto University of Education, Kyoto University of Education	Partner Country's Implementing Organization: Ministry of Education (MoE) National Electronics and Computer Technology Center (NECTEC)
Period of Cooperation: 1 March, 2002 - 28 February, 2005	Related Cooperation: -
1-1. Background of the Project	
<p>Thailand has set up the National Information Technology Committee in 1992 to promote Information and Communication Technology (ICT) policy as well as to introduce education reform programs with an emphasis on capacity building in ICT. The government of Thailand recognized the necessity to develop effective curriculum and materials to enhance the skill of teachers for capacity building in ICT for education. Accordingly, in 2001, the Government of Thailand requested the Government of Japan to implement a technical cooperation project to promote the ICT applications in primary and secondary school. Based on the request, 'Capacity Building on the Development of Information Technology for Education (ITEd) Project' was launched in March 2002 for the project period of 3 years. Project activities were implemented as planned at Bangkok Center and 5 Non-Formal Education Centers (NFECs). All centers worked together to facilitate ITEd training courses under the certification system. ICT applications in primary and secondary school were diffused in the target area by the project through training, Web-Based Training (WBT) development, and publicity activities.</p>	
1-2. Project Overview	
(1) Overall Goal	
Implementation of the courses under certification system and promotion activities of new education approaches advocated by the project are expanded for the achievement of the Ministry of Education's ICT Master Plan.	
(2) Project Purpose	
The ICT applications in primary and secondary school promoted by the ITEd through training, WBT development and publicity activities are diffused in the model areas.	
(3) Outputs	
1. Development of established ITEd model certification system and WBT use in education	
2. Development of Bangkok Center as planning, coordination and supportive unit for operations of certification	
3. Development of updated Practical and effective standardized training courses	
4. Implementation of established ITEd courses by the 5 NFECs	
5. Production of WBT materials by Bangkok Center and NECTEC	

(4) Inputs**Japanese side (Total cost: appr. 511 million Yen):**

Long-term Expert: 4 persons	Equipment: 301 million Yen
Short-term Expert: 30 persons	Consultant Cost: 45 million Yen
C/P Training in Japan: 36 persons	Activities Cost: 42 million Yen
Japan Overseas Cooperation Volunteer: 4 persons	

Thai side:

Counterpart: 53 persons	Local Cost: 80,350,660 THB
Land, building, facilities	

2. EVALUATION TEAM

Evaluation Team	Evaluation Analysis:	Thanomporn Laohajatsang (Ms.) (Chiang Mai Univ.)
	Support for Evaluation Analysis:	Takehiro Iwaki (Mr.) (IC Net Asia Co., Ltd.)
	Assistant Researcher:	Praweenya Suwannathachote (Ms.) (Chulalongkorn Univ.)
	Assistant Researcher:	Dusita Krawanchid (Ms.) (IC Net Asia Co., Ltd)

Period of Evaluation: 24 October 2007- 29 February 2008 | **Type of Evaluation:** Ex-post Evaluation

3. PROJECT PERFORMANCE**3-1. Performance of Project Purpose**

Outputs of the ITed Project have been remained as key components in capacity development of primary and secondary teachers and educational personnel in ICT for education. The methods promoted by the project have been widely utilized. During 2005-2007, 11,876 teachers participated in the training courses developed by the project. Four WBT materials developed during the project are still being used. Mobile training courses have been conducted by using curriculum and teaching materials of Course A by 2 NFECs after the termination of the project. All the trainees contacted during the ex-post evaluation study recognized the improvement of their skills to use computer programs in their teaching.

3-2. Achievement related to Overall Goal

The model certification courses are conducted regularly and WBT advocated by the project have been utilized in the school. The project has laid the groundwork for the capacity development of concerned personnel in ICT for education. The impact of the project conforms to the strategy of the ICT for Education Master Plan of the MoE.

3-3. Follow-up of the Recommendations by Terminal Evaluation Study

Following 6 recommendations were made by the Terminal Evaluation Study

1. Recommendation for trainers to;
 - 1) encourage participants to use examples which contain real situation and environmental surroundings
 - 2) motivate participants to improve teaching skills and to organize seminar course in their schools
 - 3) try to integrate education programs that participants have in their daily education activities
 - 4) try to let participants consider the real situation and environment surrounding them
 - 5) inviting experienced participants to the training to act as sub-instructors

2. Teaching materials should be utilized by the instructors keeping the localization in each site in mind.
3. Knowledge and skills of training participants should be levelled for effective and efficient implementation of the training course
4. Certification should be issued with certain conditions
5. Appropriate media for WBT should be selected based on the development of the infrastructure
6. After the approval of the Action Plan developed by the MoE, the training course should be expanded to key personnel from Educational Service Areas (ESA) and schools utilizing the teachers trained in the project. It is also necessary to clarify the role and organizational structure of the Bangkok Center and 5 NFECs.

All the recommendations except Recommendation 6 have been practiced. Although some of training courses have been expanded to key personnel from ESAs and schools as recommended, the role and organization structure of the Bangkok Center and 5 NFECs have not been clearly defined yet. The role and responsibilities regarding the project activities are spread to 3 separate units of the MoE, namely Office of Permanent Secretary (OPES), NFECs, and Bureau of Technology for Teaching and Learning (BTTL), due to the organizational restructuring in the MoE.

4. RESULTS OF EVALUATION

4-1. Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Impact

<Achievement of Overall Goal>

Although there is no presetting of measurable indicators to evaluate the achievement of project overall goal, from the evaluation result, it is fair to say that the overall goal of the project has been achieved. The ITed model certification system keeps expanding ICT utilization in teaching and learning in Thailand. Major findings are summarised below.

- The direction of the project on human capacity development in ICT for education is remained as one of the major goals in the draft of MoE's new ICT for Education Master Plan (2007-2011).
- In the Action Plan for the Utilization of Information Technology for Teaching and Learning (2006-2007), 2,400 and 240 core teachers were to be trained on Course B and Course C, respectively.
- The current Action Plan of the Office of Basic Education Commission (OBEC) (2007-2008) reflects the impact of the project by including training curriculum and materials of Course B and C as a major component for the capacity building of primary and secondary teachers and educational personnel.
- Four WBT materials developed during the project are still being used in education. Regarding the production of material, the development approach has been extended from co-producing with NECTEC to give budgetary support for WBT materials development through; a) outsourcing software houses to produce the materials, and b) training teachers to produce the materials themselves.
- Factors, such as policy and regulation set by the MoE, status of ICT readiness in schools, and increasing awareness of ICT utilization in teaching and learning are considered as major external factors for the achievement of the overall goal.

<Other impacts>

- There has been a positive impact on the role of 5 NFECs which have now become training centers not only in their provinces but also other provinces in the region to provide ICT training services for teachers, educational personnel and staff of NFECs.
- The ex-counterparts have been applying the systematic way of thinking, which they learned through systematic project management during the project, to their work and training.
- The study team did not identify any negative impacts of the project.

(2) Sustainability

As an implementing agency of the project, MoE has been utilizing the knowledge and skills gained from the project to promote the ICT for education. Major findings are summarised below.

<Organizational and human recourse aspects>

- Majority of ex-counterparts remain working at NFECs and concerned organizations in Bangkok. Bangkok Center has been organizationally closed due to the policy of the MoE to allocate the budget for concerned activities to the OBEC and Office of Non-Formal Education (ONFE) separately based on the proposed action plans.

<Technical aspects>

- The ITed 3 courses were revised and adapted to meet needs of trainees.
- The utilization of equipment procured by the project has been optimized in general. However, utilization of some equipment has been limited due to the unavailability and high price of certain spare parts.

<Financial aspects>

- As the needs for human capacity development on ICT for NFE teachers have been increased, the government has been increasing the allocation of the budget for 5 NFECs. It can be said that the project activities and services have been maintained efficiently by 5 NFECs with the increasing course numbers and positive evaluation by the trainees. However, the budget allocation for training courses has been still insufficient to respond to the increasing demand for teacher training in ICT for teaching and learning.

4-2. Factors that have promoted project**(1) Impact**

- The policy of the former government on ICT for education supported the implementation of the project activities well. Recent policy of the MoE has also made teachers and educational personnel aware of the importance of ICT use.
- Development of ICT infrastructure in schools has been contributing to the expansion of ICT for education. The computer use for education and administration in Thailand is on the rise. Internet connection has been completed in every school under the OBEC.
- The widespread use of ICT in the "IT Age" has enhanced the needs for teachers to update their skills and knowledge on ICT. The advance of technology also has made teachers realize the importance of ICT for education.

(2) Sustainability

- Factors that have promoted project impact are also considered as factors that have promoted project sustainability.

4-3. Factors that have inhibited project

(1) Impact

- Two-thirds of the teachers under the OBEC are still left untrained for the use of ICT. The demands for training teachers in ICT for teaching and learning are over the supplies with the increasing awareness of teachers on the importance of ICT. Despite the rising number of trained teachers and the provision of increasing training budget, the budget allocation for ITed training courses has been still insufficient.
- Political instability may partially be viewed as a disturbing factor for the pursuance of ICT for education policy. Several projects of the former government related to ICT for education have been postponed, changed or terminated by the change of the government.

(2) Sustainability

- Factors that have inhibited project impact are also considered as factors that have disturbed project sustainability.

4-4. Conclusions

ITed Project has been contributing to the expansion of ICT applications in primary and secondary schools and, eventually, achievement of MoE's ICT for Education Master Plan by the established ITed model certification system with training Course A, B, and C. By utilizing equipment, skills and knowledge acquired during the project, 5 NFECs have been implementing training courses efficiently. The trainees of the ITed courses appreciate the skills and knowledge gained from the training and continue to use them in their teaching. It is expected that the training by ex-counterparts at 5 NFECs will be maintained.

4-5. Recommendations

There are following recommendations to MoE.

- Training budget and maintenance costs for the equipment procured by the project should be supported by the MoE to enhance the sustainability of the project. Although the project activities have been embedded into government policy and have received increasing budget allocation, there are needs for further increase of the budget.
- It is recommended to strengthen the partnership between ESAs and NFECs. As the ESAs have become the main units responsible for training teachers throughout Thailand, stronger partnership will help maintain training services of the 5 NFECs and for other MoE's human capacity development activities in the future.
- With its institutional capacity, technical expertise, and experience in practice, it is fair to say that some of NFECs, with the coordination of the OBEC, are capable of conducting training programs on ICT for teaching and learning for the countries in the Greater Mekong Sub-region. It is expected that the implementation of the training programs will also enhance the motivation of staff to develop NFECs as training centers in the region.

4-6. Lessons Learned

- To ensure the sustainability of the project, the long term project plan, particularly in terms of roles and responsibilities of counterpart organizations, as also recommended by the Terminal Evaluation Study, should be clarified.
- Local vendors who can support hardware and software as well as offer after-sales services for the project should

be identified. Acquiring decent local vendors and products will help sustain the project effect through equipment utilization and reduction of maintenance costs.

- In this ex-post evaluation study, the team found lack of understanding among Thai ex-counterparts on the project overall goal and evaluation methods. Making the overall goal of the project known by project counterparts may help encourage the counterparts to sustain the project activities and consequently to better achieve the overall goal of the project.
- The project design should be made carefully to come up with the details of master plans in the related fields at the beginning of the project.
- Clear and measurable indicators for the project overall goal should be specified in the project design. With clear and measurable indicators, the result of the project impacts can be evaluated objectively.

4-7. Follow-up Situation

Follow-up programs have not been carried out by the Japanese side since the project completion in 2005