## Summary of Terminal Evaluation

### 1. Outline of the Project

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Issue/Sector: Integrated regional development planning</td>
<td>Cooperation scheme: Technical Cooperation Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Division in charge: Peace Building and Urban and Regional Development Division 2, Economic Infrastructure Department</td>
<td>Total cost (estimated at the end of March 2012): 408 million yen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Extension):- (F/U):-</td>
<td>Supporting Organization in Japan: Ministry of Land, Infrastructure, Transport and Tourism, ALMEC CORPORATION</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 1-1 Background of the Project

The major cities in Socialist Republic of Vietnam have been rapidly urbanizing due to the progress of strong economic growth and rapid motorization. Rapid population flow from rural areas have caused overt urban issues, such as, shortage of housing, increasing of irregular construction, traffic jam, shortage of water supply, environmental deterioration etc. Further economic development in future might accelerate such issues not only in big cities but also in medium or small cities. Therefore, the necessity of appropriate urban planning and the management are strongly requested now.

Vietnamese Government has issued “Construction Law” in 2004 to designate the Urban Planning (Space Planning) as the role of local Peoples Committee to promote the decentralization. Vietnamese Government has also issued the new “Urban Planning Law” in January 2010 by integrating the existing regulations and adding new articles to forward these political movements.

In order to attend to and prepare for the impact of urbanization, JICA has provided technical assistance to Vietnam through a series of urban planning projects, namely:

(ii) “The Study on the Urban Transport Master Plan and Feasibility Study in HCM Metropolitan Area” (HOUTRANS) in 2002-2004; and

Vietnamese side had much interest in the process and outputs of these studies, and recognized the necessity of introduction of scientific tool and methodology for urban planning formulation based on the actual data. Thus MOC requested to Japan a technical cooperation project to strengthen the capacity of the officers of local government in charge of urban planning by developing practical manuals and establishing training course for them. VIAP was nominated as the counterpart of the Project.

### 1-2 Project Overview

(1) Overall Goal

With the support of the Vietnam Urban Planning Training Center, local government...
officers of major medium-sized cities acquire knowledge on new urban planning formulation methodology.

(2) Project Purpose
The Vietnam Urban Planning Training Center under VIAP is capable to conduct training courses for urban planning method.

(3) Outputs
【Output1】Urban planning formulation manual is developed.
【Output2】Urban master plans for a selected city are formulated as a case study.
【Output3】Trainers are developed
【Output4】Training courses are established
【Output5】Proposals area made for new urban plan management tools.
【Output6】The Vietnam Urban Planning Training Center is established under VIAP

(4) Inputs (as of the end of March 2012)
Japanese side:
- Long-term Expert: 1 person
- Provision of equipment: US$163,917
- Short-term Expert: 100.03MM
- Local cost expenditure: 65 million yen
- Trainees received in Japan: 31 persons
- Others: local consultants, secretaries: 283.0MM

Vietnamese side:
- C/P: 58 persons
- Provision of equipment: -
- Provision of land and facilities: Office
- Local Cost: unknown
- Others: Preparation of the training room

2. Evaluation Team

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Members of Evaluation Team</th>
<th>Mr. Hiroyuki HAYASHI Team Leader JICA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Naofumi TAKEUCHI Urban Planning System Organization for Promoting Urban Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Koki KANEDA Evaluation Analysis Pegasus Engineering Co.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Reiko FUNABA Cooperation Planning JICA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Period of Evaluation | From 25 March 2012 to 7 April 2012 |
|---------------------------------------------------------------|
| Type of Evaluation | Terminal |

3. Results of Evaluation

3-1 Achievement

1) Achievement of Outputs

【Output1】
Output1 is expected to be achieved. The urban planning formulation manuals are in finalizing stage under the cooperation with Manual Team. The manuals are expected to be completed by May 2012.

【Output2】
Output2 has been almost achieved.
Urban planning formulation manuals are being revised referring to the lessons extracted from Case Study. The revised Urban planning formulation manuals will be used in the 2nd trial training in May 2012.

【Output3】
Achievement degree of Output 3 is difficult to verify quantitatively since the target number of TOT has not been set clearly. Though candidates of trainers have developed their capacity through OJT, workshops and seminars on specific themes in the case study and manual revision task.
Official nomination of trainers will be done when preparation for the full-scale training activities are started based on Decision 213 /QD-VKTQH dated June 18, 2009 and the experience of trial trainings.

**Output4**

Output4 has been partly achieved. Curriculums/syllabuses, training materials and implementation manuals will be developed based on the revised urban planning manuals by May 2012. VIAP is required to pay more effort to prepare materials and handbooks for the full-scale training referring to trial trainings.

**Output5**

Output5 is expected to be achieved. Report on proposals on tools for urban planning management is under preparation in accordance with the preparation of final version of manuals. If urban planning management tools are successfully integrated into Urban planning formulation manuals with plain and practical proposal, Output5 will be achieved.

**Output6**

Urban Planning Training Center has achieved from organizational aspect by reorganizing existing Center for Training & International Cooperation.

Output 6 will be achieved if VIAP promotes its activities toward actual implementation of full-scale training with allocation of necessary staffs and budget.

2) Prospect of achieving Project Purpose

Project Purpose is expected to be achieved. Although a decision has been made by VIAP to implement training activities under Center for Training & International Cooperation under VIAP, they still need to develop an execution plan including budgetary plan in more detailed way.

Preparation of training room has been completed with necessary equipment installation. Preparation of training materials and development of training course are now on-going.

It is necessary for VIAP to make the contents of plan of the training center clearer in early occasion.

3-2 Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance: High
- In the draft of the 9th social economic five year development plan of Vietnam (2011-2015), urban development, traffic network construction and infrastructure system development necessary for modern society are positioned to be one of the focus areas.
- Japanese Government aid policy has not been changed since the preliminary project evaluation.
- Trend of rapid urbanization and expansion of medium size local cities in Vietnam remain the same or rather accelerated.
- The enactment of the new Urban Planning Law indicates the surge of recognition on the importance of urban planning.
- Vietnam is in the transition period from planned economy system to market economy system and urban planners are becoming aware of the limitation of the conventional urban planning methodology under planned economy. New and scientific planning approach adopted in this Project is highly recognized by most of the counterparts involved in this Project due to its awareness raising effect on the importance of planning based on reliable data.
(2) Effectiveness: Relatively good
• It is expected that Project Purpose is likely to be achieved.
• Regarding Output6, decision No.02/QD-VKTQH has been issued in January 2012 to enhance the training function of existing department of VIAP. This has naturally led to achieving Output6 instead of establishing a new organization as VUPTC.
• It can be said that the basic idea and the techniques necessary for implementing training courses for local government officers are transferred firmly to VIAP through preparation of urban planning formulation manuals, training materials, syllabus or curricula, and implementation of trial training itself.
• Causal relationship between Outputs and Project Purpose is high since Project Purpose is set to be achieved through achieving Output1 through Output6 which are each necessary component for establishing the training courses for urban planning formulation and management.

(3) Efficiency: Relatively good
• All the equipment installed in the No.1 training room located in the 3rd floor of the VIAP building was installed in a proper manner and in good condition.
• Case study has put significant impact on the counterparts.
• Study tours/trainings in Japan also had strong impact on the participants, and as a consequence, the importance of urban planning management has become recognized more than ever.
• However, due to late start-up of the Project, operation of the Project suffered from delay.
• Vietnamese side pointed out that short assignment and inappropriate timing of dispatch of Japanese experts put extra burden of schedule coordination. This point still remains as an issue.

(4) Impact
VIAP has enough capability to implement more activities for achieving Overall Goals which has an indicator as “More than 150 participants received certificate of training courses of VUPTC”.
• Positive impact observed is raising awareness on the difficulty of adopting current urban planning regulatory framework into real urban space.
• In particular, one of the large positive impact is that one of the external conditions to achieve the Overall Goal, “local government officers of major medium-sized cities acquire knowledge on new urban planning formulation methodology” is being facilitated by achievement of Output 5 “Proposals are made for new urban planning management tools”. If the direction on new urban planning formulation and urban management suggested by the Project is recognized as reasonable even in the context of urban area and the urban development system in reality, this kind of positive impact might be multiplied further.
• Negative impact has not been observed.

(5) Sustainability: relatively good
1) Political aspect
VIAP has strongly committed to implement the training courses to local government officers after completion of the Project based on the decision No.02/QD-VKTQH.
2) Organizational and financial aspect
- VIAP is a public, scientific and technological organization which is capable to generate income. It will be possible for VIAP to allocate necessary budget and staffs to implement training courses after establishing a certain business model. Obtaining subsidies from relevant Ministries and/or organizations may further secure the sustainability in financial aspect.
- When VIAP offers consultation works to local governments in connection with urban planning, they will try to adopt the new methodology which has been transferred by the Project as much as possible. The methodology will be spread out to local government officers.

3) Technical aspect
- The training curricula, syllabus and other materials, which are Outputs of technical transfer of the Project, will be utilized in the training courses for local government officers in the Center for Training & International Cooperation stipulated the above mentioned decision.
- Urban planning formulation manual is being revised to be suited to Vietnamese situation. This revision is being done by joint work of VIAP and Japanese expert team. VIAP has acquired knowledge and technology that can be utilized for future revision according to the variations of training courses.

4) Social, cultural and environmental aspect
None.

3-3 Contributing factors
- Strong commitment and contribution by Hai Duong Province/City to the case study has brought reality from the ground into urban planning. The results of case study has been reflected to the Urban planning formulation manuals and proposals for improvement of urban planning management and led to achievement of high efficiency of the Project bringing synergy among several Outputs.
- Practical and scientific approaches, such as HIS (Household Interview Survey) and GIS (Geographic Information System) etc., are adopted to lead to achievement of Output 1 and 2 since they provided Counterparts with technical help to understand the scientific approach in urban planning formulation.

3-4 Impeding factors
- Difficulty in establishing common base of understanding stems from the difference of underlying logic of urban planning and terminology.
- Difficulty in obtaining information, data and maps.
- Language barrier put more constraints to coordinate and allocate interpreter appropriately.
- Due to late start-up of the Project caused by the administration at Vietnamese side, official operation of the Project suffered from delay.

3-5 Conclusion
The team evaluated that it is one of the significant results for VIAP to become deeply aware of importance of modern urban planning methods and also be able to accumulate/extend knowledge about practical approaches/operations for urban planning methods.

Although the Project Purpose is likely to be achieved in May 2012 as planned, VIAP
needs to maintain or even to expand the training capability with continuous effort.

3-6  Recommendations

The business plan of training activities by Urban Planning Training Center still needs to be developed by VIAP well.

Official nomination of trainers should be done by MOC in timely manner.

Equipment provided by JICA should be maintained and utilized properly by VIAP after the Project termination.

3-7  Lessons Learned

(1)  Notable points in the future projects implemented in Vietnam

It took time to get approval of the Project from Vietnamese government. As a result, this affected significantly to the Project start, progress, and input from Japanese side, i.e. dispatch schedule of JET.

It is recommended that R/D should mention clearly such administrative issues of the counterpart agencies in Vietnam after sufficient consultation through implementation of the detailed planning survey before the start of projects.

It might be worth considering dispatch of JICA long-term expert(s) for further confirmation of the needs and issues of counterpart agencies or country prior to dispatch of consultant expert team in order to avoid significant delay that might be caused by mismatch of project framework to the Vietnamese actual situation.

(2)  Verification of the system based on the actual situation

Although the training for local government officers is important tool, it is also necessary to verify the system or regulations related to urban planning through actual urban development projects and planning practices targeting actual cities or areas similarly to the case study of Hai Duong. Needless to say, this is for the purpose to facilitate the sound development of local cities of which environment are apt to be influenced by the transition to market economy. Realization of such regulations will lead to further expansion of Outputs of the Project.