

Summary Sheet for Result of Final Evaluation

1. Outline of the Project	
Country: Bulgaria	Project title: Kazanlak Area Revitalization Project
Issue/Sector: Promotion of Tourism	Cooperation scheme: Technical Cooperation Project
Division in charge: Social Development Division	Total cost (at the time of evaluation): 326,356 (thousand yen)
Period of Cooperation	(R/D): November, 2004 - October 30, 2007
	Implementing Organization: Ministry of Economy, Energy and Tourism, and Kazanlak Municipality
	Supporting Organization in Japan: PADECO
	(Extension):
	(F/U) :
	(E/N)(Grant aid)
<p>1-1 Background of the Project</p> <p>It is one of the most important and urgent issues for the Government of Bulgaria to be admitted to the European Union in the year 2007. The steady economic growth rate was maintained and the unemployment rate is decreased; in terms of macroeconomic indicators, the favorable development was attained towards the EU accession. JICA also supported Bulgarian Policy from September 1999 to September 2002, through “The Japanese Cooperation to Support the Formulation of Key Government Policies on Industry in the Republic of Bulgaria”.</p> <p>On the other hand, Government of Bulgaria has a concern that economic overconcentration in Sofia, the capital city (16% of the population) and widening gap between the urban and suburban area may slow down the economic growth. The Government established six priority programs including “Sustainable Development of Economy and Improvement of Business Climate” which places an importance on the regional economic development through promotion of tourism, agriculture and forestry as well as reduction of regional disparities.</p> <p>Under the circumstances, the Government of Bulgaria requested the Government of Japan the technical cooperation in 2003 for revitalizing the Kazanlak area. The objective of the project was to develop an environment for rose oil industry nationwide through transferring the technology, as well as know-how and knowledge of participatory regional promotion in Kazanlak where well-known for rose valley and rose oil industry, as the model regions.</p> <p>In response to the request, JICA dispatched project formulation adviser to develop project framework. The project consists of five strategies, i) tourism area strategy, ii) tourism event strategy, iii) special product strategy, iv) tourism human resource development strategy and v) infrastructure improvement strategy. The establishment of the Kazanlak Regional Development Council (hereinafter referred to as “KRDC”) was proposed as an implementing organization.</p> <p>JICA dispatched the preliminary study team to discuss the cooperation components in June 2004 and Record of Discussion (R/D) signed on 16th June. The 3-year-planned project has started on November 2004.</p> <p>1-2 Project Overview (based on PDM introduced in this evaluation study)</p> <p>(1) Overall Goal</p> <p>①Economy is enhanced by the regional development mainly through tourism development and the living</p>	

standards of the Kazanlak Municipality are improved.

②A regional development model is established and contributes to development promotion in less developed areas in Bulgaria

(2) Project Purpose

The number of tourists to Kazanlak increases throughout the year through the synergy effect of five (5) tourism development strategies.

(3) Outputs

Output 1: (Institutions/Organization)

Organizations in charge of regional development are established and managed.

Output 2: (Human Resource Development)

Human resource is developed to promote regional/tourism development in Kazanlak as well as to provide services to satisfy tourist needs.

Output 3: (Infrastructure Improvement Strategy)

Various infrastructures are developed and improved for visiting, staying and sightseeing in Kazanlak.

Output 4: (Tourism Area Strategy)

Tourism areas are developed based on the regional characteristics of Kazanlak.

Output 5: (Tourism Event Strategy)

Tourism promotion events are planned and managed and many people come to Kazanlak in various seasons.

Output 6: (Special Product Strategy)

Special products are produced by making the most of Kazanlak's nature, tradition, history, etc. and satisfy tourist needs.

Output 7: (Hospitality/Tourism Human Resource Development Strategy)

Employees in the tourism industry become guest-oriented and hospitality is improved.

However, the measurability of level of achievement for tourism human resource development strategy shall be taken in account, therefore the measurement of output for Output 2 (Human Resource Development) and Output 7 (Hospitality/Tourism Human Resource Development Strategy) are separated.

(4) Inputs (at the time of evaluation)

Japanese side:

Expert 11 persons

Equipment Computer (software and hardware), air conditioner, printer, etc.

Local cost 57,063,305 yen

Accepted Training Participants 6 persons

Bulgarian Side: Counterpart 6 persons Project office for experts Local Cost Project cost																
2 Evaluation Team																
Members of Evaluation Team	(Specialized field: name, title) Leader: Nobuhiro Koyama (JICA Research Institute, Senior Advisor) Evaluation Planning: Akihito Sanjo (JICA Planning & Coordination Department, Planning Group, Project Planning Team, Chief) Evaluation Analyze: You Kishinami (International Development Associates Ltd. permanent expert)															
Period of Evaluation	June 11, 2007 – June 21, 2007	Type of Evaluation: Final														
3. Results of Evaluation																
3-1 Confirmation of results (Degree of achievement of the Project Purpose) The achievements of the indicators of the Project Purpose are shown below. Both project progressed steadily, and by November 2007, when the project is planned to end, all indicators are expected to be satisfied.																
<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Indicator</th> <th>Degree of achievement</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1 Tourist information regarding Kazanlak is obtained easier than before.</td> <td>Information Center has been extended both in space and capacity and it is now capable of providing necessary information for tourists.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2 There are more choices for accommodation facilities, and reservations get easier in Kazanlak.</td> <td>There are 12 private lodging which did not exist before the Project started. Reservations can be made through the Information Center and the website established by the Project.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3 There are more activities and diversified ways of entertainments in Kazanlak</td> <td>There are more tourist activities and according to the monitoring tours, the newly developed Thracian show was highly evaluated.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4 There are more choices for souvenirs and those of good quality can be obtained easier.</td> <td>There are more special products and according to the monitoring tours, newly developed products were highly evaluated.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>5 Participatory system is established and managed to realize the above 1-4.</td> <td>Kazanlak Sustainable Tourism Association (hereinafter referred to as “KSTA”) is a participatory organization in order to manage the Information Center, private lodgings, tour activities and products.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>6 Human resource in charge of the above 1-5 is widely developed and improved.</td> <td>Human resource has been developed through the Project activities. Each of the above 1-5 has at least one counterpart personnel from the municipality and one stakeholder of the private sector trained during the course of the Project.</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>			Indicator	Degree of achievement	1 Tourist information regarding Kazanlak is obtained easier than before.	Information Center has been extended both in space and capacity and it is now capable of providing necessary information for tourists.	2 There are more choices for accommodation facilities, and reservations get easier in Kazanlak.	There are 12 private lodging which did not exist before the Project started. Reservations can be made through the Information Center and the website established by the Project.	3 There are more activities and diversified ways of entertainments in Kazanlak	There are more tourist activities and according to the monitoring tours, the newly developed Thracian show was highly evaluated.	4 There are more choices for souvenirs and those of good quality can be obtained easier.	There are more special products and according to the monitoring tours, newly developed products were highly evaluated.	5 Participatory system is established and managed to realize the above 1-4.	Kazanlak Sustainable Tourism Association (hereinafter referred to as “KSTA”) is a participatory organization in order to manage the Information Center, private lodgings, tour activities and products.	6 Human resource in charge of the above 1-5 is widely developed and improved.	Human resource has been developed through the Project activities. Each of the above 1-5 has at least one counterpart personnel from the municipality and one stakeholder of the private sector trained during the course of the Project.
Indicator	Degree of achievement															
1 Tourist information regarding Kazanlak is obtained easier than before.	Information Center has been extended both in space and capacity and it is now capable of providing necessary information for tourists.															
2 There are more choices for accommodation facilities, and reservations get easier in Kazanlak.	There are 12 private lodging which did not exist before the Project started. Reservations can be made through the Information Center and the website established by the Project.															
3 There are more activities and diversified ways of entertainments in Kazanlak	There are more tourist activities and according to the monitoring tours, the newly developed Thracian show was highly evaluated.															
4 There are more choices for souvenirs and those of good quality can be obtained easier.	There are more special products and according to the monitoring tours, newly developed products were highly evaluated.															
5 Participatory system is established and managed to realize the above 1-4.	Kazanlak Sustainable Tourism Association (hereinafter referred to as “KSTA”) is a participatory organization in order to manage the Information Center, private lodgings, tour activities and products.															
6 Human resource in charge of the above 1-5 is widely developed and improved.	Human resource has been developed through the Project activities. Each of the above 1-5 has at least one counterpart personnel from the municipality and one stakeholder of the private sector trained during the course of the Project.															

3-2 Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance

The Government of Bulgaria has making its utmost efforts to be a member of European Union (EU) through restructuring and adjustment of such traditional systems as legal institution, administration and economy. "Regional Development Law" enacted in February 2004 is one of the most important legal change which places an emphasis on the role of local administration for regional development to improve living standard of local people. The Project, which aims at regional development under the leadership of municipality, is just in line with the national policy.

As globalization and urbanization proceeds, many people, especially young people, have a strong tendency to move from their home town to bigger cities and towns to find better job opportunities. The Project, which aims at tourism development based on its natural endowment and historical heritage, intends to revitalize the municipal economy through wider involvement of local people. The Project aims at tourism development of Kazanlak municipality by way of five strategies. These five strategies which duly represent the vital components of tourism development can produce their own outputs respectively but when they are programmed and integrated to produce synergy effects, their outputs will become more significant in inviting tourists to Kazanlak. The composition of the Project is judged relevant.

(2) Effectiveness

Tourist visit to Kazanlak has been steadily increasing since the commencement of the Project in terms of annual total tourists (76,500 persons in 2004, 83,600 persons in 2005, and 114,800 persons in 2006). It is estimated that tourism related sales and job opportunities would have been increased in tandem with the increasing tourist visit therefore the contribution of the project was large, and was effective.

The Tourism Area Strategy and Tourism Event Strategy contributed to the increase of tourists, compared to the other strategies of the five.

(3) Efficiency

Efficiency of the Project is considered relatively high in terms of relationship between inputs and outputs. In the Project, collaboration between the Bulgarian side, counterparts in particular, and the Japanese side, JICA experts in particular, has been critical in achieving the Project purpose. The Project purpose seemed to have been duly achieved, partly because of their close collaboration while both sides were there, and partly because of the effective use of local project officers who could bridge both sides while both sides were not

(4) Impact

Impacts caused by the Project could be categorized into three groups: (1) motivation for exchanging information and opinions; (2) motivation for forming collaboration groups; and (3) networking with outside world. It was a huge impact that many people involved in the project experienced that a nonconventional approach was effective for Bulgaria. It was also meaningful that the cooperation was participatory, and the information was open.

(5) Sustainability

Personnel that proactively promote tourism were cultivated through the project. Additionally, the implementation structure is about to be organized after the completion of the project. The Government

of Bulgaria would continue supporting development of less developed regions through the introduction of EU Structure Funds. Kazanlak Municipality needs to make its best efforts to get the Government support for regional development to improve the sustainability of the Project.

3-3 Facilitating Factors

(1) Factors concerning to Planning

For the factors that promoted realization of effects, the contents of the plan aligned with both nation and sector policies, and were the priority issue of the Ministry of Economy, Energy and Tourism, as well as Kazanlak Municipality. Therefore, the plan was timely and attracted the interest of these organizations.

(2) Factors concerning to the Implementation Process

Utilizing local NGO other than the Ministry of Economy, Energy and Tourism and Kazanlak which are the main target groups, was effective to enhance the sustainability. Additionally, since there are a number of organizations for implementing the project or related to it, JCC (Joint Coordination Committee) has been held eight times until now, in order to share the progress, problems, and information of the project.

3-4 Impeding Factors

(1) Factors concerning to Planning

None.

(2) Factors concerning to the Implementation Process

None.

3-5 Conclusion

Owing to the strong leadership of the Project director, Mayor of Kazanlak Municipality, and excellent team works between Japanese experts and Bulgarian counterparts, the Project has been successfully implemented so far and achieved its project purpose to a satisfactory extent.

New implementation system, which is responsible for the tourism promotion and development in Kazanlak area after the completion of the Project, is under preparation. In order to maintain knowledge on the regional development and management know-how, which were transferred by Japanese experts, the Project should focus on the strengthening of the new system towards the end of the Project. To achieve its target, it is effective to extend project period and support additionally strengthening of organization structure and operational capability.

3-6 Recommendations (specific measures, suggestions and advice related to the project)

Below statements are proposed by the joint evaluation team.

(1) Necessity of increased Budget

In order to maintain the smooth implementation it is necessary for KSTA to secure the financial resources for operation cost and personnel, advertisement, facility investment cost etc. It is desirable that in addition to ordinary budget, the Project secure the other financial resources, such as "EU Structure Fund", financial scheme of European Union(EU) and that the Kazanlak Municipality provide necessary supports to KSTA, including the provision of office space.

(2) Comprehensive Approach and Synergy Effect

One of the advantages of the Project is "Comprehensive approach", which consists of 5(five)

strategies; (i)tourism area strategy; (ii)tourism event strategy, (iii)special product strategy, (iv)tourism human resource development strategy, (v) infrastructure improvement strategy. It is desirable that Kazanlak Municipality keep adapting the comprehensive approach to create the synergy effects by the close collaboration among relevant organizations.

(3) Improvement of Monitoring System

It is quite essential that the monitoring system be established in order to measure how much the Kazanlak area is revitalized through the activities, because the monitoring results are significantly useful for the better project management. Although the baseline survey was carried out at the beginning of Project period, the data was not continuously corrected. It is, therefore, desirable to set up more appropriate and available indicators and to correct the data periodically.

(4) Involvement of Private Sector

For the further revitalization and the diversified development in Kazanlak area it is preferable that the private sector participate much more. In order to realize it, Kazanlak Municipality should establish the institutional and legal environment to involve relevant private organizations/firms.

(5) Collaboration with Neighboring Municipalities

In order to increase the number of the tourists, Kazanlak Municipality has to consider not only tourism development programs within Kazanlak area but also joint programs with vicinal cities/towns. It is quite essential that Kazanlak Municipality collaborate with neighboring municipalities, such as co-development of tourism routes, co-advertisement of tourism events.

(6) Dissemination of Kazanlak Model

Model”, regional development framework and methodology which the Project made into practice and summarized, should be applied to less developed areas. For the dissemination and application of “Kazanlak Model”, the initiative of the existing networks such as “Nationwide Local Government Association”, Alumni association of the ex-participant of JICA training program should be utilized with the coordination of the Ministry of Economy and Energy.

3-7 Lessons Learned (Cases from this projects that may be a reference for the discovery, formulation, implementation, and operation for other similar projects)

(1) Strong Leadership

It was a significant successful factor for the implementation of the Project that Mayor of Kazanlak Municipality possessed strong and coherent leadership from the beginning. Without the leadership, the Bulgarian counterparts and stakeholders with various opinions would not be teamed up for the smooth implementation.

(2) Importance of Ownership

In the Project, JICA took different approach from the typical technical cooperation. In general, a few long-term experts are assigned during all the project period, however, input of the Project was composed of solely short-term experts. Although the delay of the Project activity was pointed out, by contraries, development of local resources and fostering of ownership has been made by positive and independent activities even during the absence of Japanese experts.