“Advancing Women’s Participation and Leadership for Peacebuilding: The role of development agencies”

Makiko Kubota
Nami Takashi

27 August, 2015
Background of the Research

1. Progress in research and debates on women, peace and security:
   - Increased evidence of why gender matters in conflict
   - Women’s experience of empowerment through enhanced social roles and responsibilities during conflict
   - Development assistance’s role to promote women’s participation and leadership from the beginning of assistance to build better society with lasting peace

2. Current gaps:
   - Lack of understanding on women’s role and their level of participation and leadership on the ground
   - More focus on policy and advocacy while lacking operational discussions on how to effectively advance women’s participation and leadership based on empirical data
Purpose of the Research

Main Objective:
To identify effective policy and programming options for development agencies for advancing women’s participation and leadership in peacebuilding

Specific Objectives:
1. To understand key elements and determinants of women’s participation and leadership in peacebuilding within the local contexts of target areas
2. To clarify barriers and opportunities to advance women’s participation and leadership in peacebuilding
Research Methodology and Targets

- Literature review
- Field research through FGDs and KII s
- Case study approach:
  1) Philippines (Mindanao)
  2) Afghanistan
- Selection criteria:
  1) Significant level of peacebuilding assistance by development agencies including JICA
  2) Accessibility from a security perspective
Conceptual Framework of the Research: Development Assistance in Peacebuilding

Positive Peace

• True peace is not only about absence of direct violence
• Need for human development to achieve absence of structural violence

Negative Peace

• Achieve peace by military deterrence and power balance
• Need for power (military force)

“Peacebuilding involves a range of measures targeted to reduce the risk of lapsing or relapsing into conflict by strengthening national capacities at all levels for conflict management, and to lay the foundations for sustainable peace and development.”

- Secretary General’s Policy Committee, May 2007
Development Assistance in the Framework of Peacebuilding Assistance

- Military Framework
  - Multi-national Forces
  - UN PKO
  - Preventive Diplomacy
  - Arms Control
  - Humanitarian Assistance

- Political Framework

- Economic and Social Framework

For building capable, legitimate and responsive states (‘Statebuilding’)

Source: JICA, 2011 & DAC/OECD 2011
Conceptual Framework of Peacebuilding and Development Assistance

1. Political processes/ setlement
2. Responsive institutions
3. Resilience of society to crisis


Development Assistance
1. Socio-economic development
2. Good governance
3. Reform of justice and security institutions
4. Culture of truth, justice and reconciliation

DAC, 2008

Women's Participation
Women's Leadership
# Level of Women’s Participation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Citizen Control</td>
<td><strong>Citizen Power</strong> (obtaining full managerial power)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Delegated Power</td>
<td><strong>Citizen Power</strong> (achieving dominant decision-making authority)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Partnership</td>
<td><strong>Citizen Power</strong> (enabling to negotiate and engage in trade-offs with powerholders)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Placation</td>
<td><strong>Tokenism</strong> (allowing to advise but powerholders retain the right to decide)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Consultation</td>
<td><strong>Tokenism</strong> (consulting without assurance that their concerns and ideas will be considered)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Informing</td>
<td><strong>Tokenism</strong> (one-way flow of information with no channel for feedback)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Therapy</td>
<td><strong>Non-participation</strong> (enabling powerholders to “cure” the participants”)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Manipulation</td>
<td><strong>Non-participation</strong> (enabling powerholders to “educate” the participants”)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Arnstein, 1969
Current Arguments on Women’s Leadership

- Lack of literatures that attempted to define women’s leadership in general
- Leadership is “a form of persuasion in the pursuit of individual or group goals, involving the capabilities for, and process of, mobilizing people and resources” (Domingo et al. 2015)
- Key elements of women’s leadership (Afkhami et al. 2011):
  a) Capitalizing on the ideas and skills of as many individuals as possible
  b) Relationship skills through interactions with collaborators, supporters, or followers
  c) An effective decision-maker who is visionary and works with others
  d) Being conscious of the processes as well as the objectives

Research assumption on women’s leadership in peacebuilding:
She is not only a woman but also has a vision and relationship skills to hear women’s needs and can lead other women and men to pursue desired social change for peacebuilding
Case Study 1: Mindanao
Conflict in Mindanao

Key Statistics of Mindanao

Population: 21,968,174 (Mindanao island group, 2000)
Ethnic groups: Maranao, Tausug, Maguindanaon, Banguingui, Lumad (indigenous)
Religion: Christian (more than 70%), Muslim (20%)
Poverty: Highest poverty incidence in the country at 38.8% (2006)
Conflict: Armed Combatant Group in Mindanao vs AFP, Rido
Status of Transitional Process

- **2012**: Framework Agreement
- **2013**: Oct
- **2014**: Mar
- **2015**: Sep
- **2016**: Oct
- **New government election (scheduled)**
- **May**: New government election (scheduled)
- **2013**: Approval of BBL (scheduled)
- **2014**: Comprehensive Agreement
- **2015**: Submission of draft BBL to Congress
- **2016**: Approval of BBL (scheduled)

Vertical and Horizontal Conflicts in Mindanao

- Vertical conflict against the state
- Horizontal conflict of “rido”
Research Methodology and Target

- **Duration of the First Mission:** 26 July – 13 August
- **Target areas:**
  1. **Manila:** Key Informant Interviews (KII) with donors and national government agencies
  2. **Maguindanao Province:** Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) with communities and KII with peace panel members, ARMM/municipal/barangay officials, religious leader and women’s NGOs/CSOs
- **Numbers of interviewees:** 71 women and 37 men (FGDs) and 26 KII
- **Key research approach:**
  1. Clarify the level of women’s participation and leadership before, during and after conflict
  2. Clarify the diversity of women’s different experiences in conflict based not only on ethnicity/religion but on class, age, level of education, etc.
Categorization of Women Based on Social Class and Religious/Cultural Identity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Muslim</th>
<th>Christian</th>
<th>Indigenous People</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Upper Class</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle Class</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower Class</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Basic Information about the Target Area

Maguindanao province
• Majority Muslim (64%) and Christian minority
• One of the lowest in the bottom 10 of provincial HDI ranking

1. Barangay Kibleg, Upi Municipality
• Majority T’duray (42%) with Muslim (31%) and Christian (27%)
• Experience in MNLF conflict and rido over land and political rivalries

2. Barangay/Camp Darapanan, Sultan Kudarat Municipality
• Majority Muslim
• Experience in MNLF/MILF conflict and rido over land and elopements by young couples

Criteria for community selection:
• Affected by regional conflict and rido
• Presence of women and men of various backgrounds
• Supported by JICA and other donors/NGOs
• Accessibility from logistics and security perspectives
Key Preliminary Findings of the First Field Research

1. Women’s Experience in conflict

Displacement, broken families, lack of access to basic needs and violence

“During the conflict under the Martial Law in the 70s, the whole community had to stay home for a half year and we survived by food supplies from the government.”

(Teduray woman, 55 yo)

“My family was involved in a long family feud over land and political rivalry since I was born. I lost my eldest sister because of that.”

(Muslim woman, 20 yo)
“While men’s mobility was limited to avoid harassment, women were raped. In the coastal areas, women were taken on a boat and some were raped and others were forced to get married.”
(Muslim man, 58 yo)

“My uncle was killed and my aunt was raped and was psychologically affected.”
(Muslim man, 40 yo)

**Increased Economic Burden**

“Several years ago, I experienced evacuation twice as a child. There was bombardment everywhere. My father was a combatant and my mother was left with so much burden to take care of her children and do farming. We had no food supply.”
(Muslim woman, 19 yo)

“There was a huge evacuation for years and people were forced to live in makeshifts in various areas. Men were in the forest away from the military and women were left with the economic burden to look after their children.”
(Muslim man, 67 yo)
Working as combatants, medical teams and conflict mediators

“Women were trained as medical aid and combatants to protect themselves and their children. We provided all kinds of support to men underground: financially, daily subsistence, healthcare, etc.” (MNLF woman)

“MNLF women provided first aid and some women who were physically and mentally strong served as combatants. There was a woman leading male combatants in Zamboanga.” (MNLF man)

“In the Bangsamoro Islamic Women Auxiliary Brigade (BIWAB), all members are trained on first aid, how to handle weapons and military tactics. Some women also received advanced military training. BIWAB is non-combatants but we are trained for self-protection and on standby in case men need our support.” (BIWAB/MILF woman)

“There are traditional leaders for Teduray: both male (Timuay) and female (Fintailan). Fintailan is often more effective than Timuay to resolve conflicts especially between men. It is based on our traditional belief that men cannot argue or abuse women.” (Teduray woman)
Changing Levels of Women’s Participation in Political, Economic and Social Spheres through Conflict

(Level of Participation)

High

Low

Before Conflict  During Conflict  After Conflict  (Phase of conflict)

Economic

Social

Political
### Who is Participating?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Class</th>
<th>Muslim</th>
<th>Christian</th>
<th>Indigenous People</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Upper Class</strong></td>
<td>Educated with influential husband/father, wealthy, connections with Manila, live in urban area</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Middle Class</strong></td>
<td>Educated, backup from husband/father, mid-level income with professional jobs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lower Class</strong></td>
<td>Grassroots, without education and resources, female headed households, live in rural area</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Political Participation**
- **Economic and Social Participation**
What is the Level of Participation?

- Woman
  - Wealth (Access to resources)
  - Awareness
  - Access to information
  - Husband/Father’s Connection
  - Social Network
  - Education

- 8. Citizen Control
- 7. Delegated Power
- 6. Partnership
- 5. Placation
- 4. Consultation
- 3. Informing
- 2. Therapy
- 1. Manipulation
Who is *NOT* Participating?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Muslim</th>
<th>Christian</th>
<th>Indigenous People</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Upper Class</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educated with influential husband/father, wealthy, connections with Manila, live in urban area</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Middle Class</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educated, backup from husband/father, mid-level income with professional jobs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lower Class</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grassroots, without education and resources, female headed households, live in rural area</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What is the Level of Participation?

Lack of access to resources

Reproductive burden

Lack of support from men

Lack of education

Lack of access to information

Economic burden

Woman

8. Citizen Control
7. Delegated Power
6. Partnership
5. Placation
4. Consultation
3. Informing
2. Therapy
1. Manipulation
Who are the Women Leaders?

- Well educated
- Intuitive
- Religious
- Bring positive change to women
- Neutral/fair
- Confident and compassionate
- Good communicator
- Trusted
- Vocal and articulate

Woman Leader
Conclusion

Development agencies should address the division among women of various social groups and their different levels of participation and leadership

1. Eliminate the barriers for lower-class women through:
   - Provision of basic services
   - Scaling up from micro-economic activities
   - Improvement of their access to information and building social networks
   - Moving away from trickle-down approach
2. Strengthen governance
3. Build capacity of Muslim women advocates
4. Conduct gender analysis looking at power dynamics beyond men-women relationships
5. Understand the changing roles of women through different phases of conflict and support their meaningful participation after conflict
Way Forward

1. Mindanao Case Study (follow up field study : 13-20 September 2015)
   *Main objectives:*
   1) To understand women’s different experiences in rido
   2) To understand women’s leadership in local context

2. Afghanistan Case Study (Field Study: 12-26 October 2015)
   *Main objective:*
   To identify effective policy and programing suggestions for
   promoting participation and leadership of Afghan female police
   officers in peacebuilding
   
   *Specific objectives:*
   1) To understand what are the elements and determinants of
      participation and leadership of female police officers in
      peacebuilding
   2) To clarify necessary conditions, enabling environment and
      interventions for female police officers to advance their
      participation and leadership in peacebuilding
Thank you!