EVALUATION REPORT ON THE PROJECT FOR STRENGTHENING REGIONAL CAPACITY ON DISASTER HEALTH MANAGEMENT (ARCH PROJECT)

December 24, 2018

Approved by

Dr. Atchariya PANGMA

Project Director, ARCH

Secretary-General,

National Institute for Emergency Medicine,

Presented by

Shuichi IKEDA

Evaluator

JICA Chief Advisor, ARCH

1. Background of the Evaluation

The Project for Strengthening Regional Capacity on Disaster Health Management (ARCH Project) was commenced in July, 2016 as an ASEAN Regional Cooperation project approved by the Committee of Permanent Representatives to ASEAN (CPR) in Jan.2016, and has been implemented as a three-year technical cooperation project until July,2019, by Thai National Institute for Emergency Medicine(NIEM), Ministry of Public Health(MOPH), and Japan International Cooperation Agency(JICA), based on a Record of Discussions (R/D) signed in Feb.2016, which constitutes the bilateral agreement for the implementation of the project under Japan's ODA. According to Article IV of the R/D stipulated for the Evaluation, JICA's Chief Advisor, as JICA's evaluator, has conducted the evaluation in consultation and collaboration with various stakeholders of the Project and has prepared this evaluation report.

2. Outline of the Project

The outline of the Project is described in the Project Design Matrix (PDM) which is attached in the last page (Annex1) of this report. Followings are summary of the Project.

2-1 Overall Goal:

"ASEAN and Japan collaboration mechanism on disaster health management is developed."

2-2 Project Purpose;

"Regional coordination on disaster health management is strengthened in ASEAN."

2-3 Outputs

Output1; "Coordination platform on disaster health management is set up."

Output2; "Framework of regional collaboration practices is developed."

Output3; "Tools for effective regional collaboration on disaster health management are developed."

Output4; "Academic network on disaster health management in AMS is enhanced."

Output5; "Capacity development activities for each AMS are implemented."

3. Objectives of the Evaluation

- (1) To verify the accomplishments of the Project compared to those planned;
- (2) To identify obstacles and/or facilitating factors that have affected the implementation process;
- (3) To analyze the Project in terms of the five evaluation criteria (i.e. Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Impact, and Sustainability); and
- (4) To make recommendations on the Project regarding the measures to be taken for the remaining period as well as the post-project period.

4. Analyses for the Evaluation

(1) Accomplishment of the Project

The accomplishment of the Project was measured in terms of the Outputs and the Project Purpose in comparison with the Objectively Verifiable Indicators of PDM as well as the plan delineated in the R/D.

(2) Implementation Process

The implementation process of the Project was reviewed to see if the Activities have been implemented according to the schedule delineated in the latest PO, and to see if the Project has been managed properly as well as to identify obstacles and/or facilitating factors that have affected the implementation process.

(3) Evaluation based on the Five Evaluation Criteria

- (a) Relevance: Relevance of the Project was reviewed to see the validity of the Project Purpose and the Overall Goal in connection with the needs of the beneficiaries and policies of the ASEAN and Japan.
- (b) Effectiveness: Effectiveness was analysed by evaluating the extent to which the Project has achieved and contributed to the beneficiaries.
- (c) Efficiency: Efficiency of the Project implementation was analysed focusing on the relationship between the Outputs and Inputs in terms of timing, quality, and quantity.
- (d) Impacts: Impacts of the Project were forecasted by referring to positive and negative impacts caused by the Project.
- (e) Sustainability: Sustainability of the Project was analysed in institutional, financial and technical aspects by examining the extent to which the achievement of the Project would be sustained and/or expanded after the

Project is completed.

4. Accomplishments of the Project

1) Activities and Outputs

Activity and Output	Progress	Outstanding issues
Output 1 Coordination platform on disaster	RCC was set up and RCC	RCC meetings will be
health management is set up.	meetings were held 4 times.	held one more time on
1-1 Regional coordination meetings are	-	next March
organized every year to share the progress		
and discuss the direction of the Project.		
Output 2 Framework of regional	RCDs were conducted 4	
collaboration practices is developed.	times, including the start-up	
2-1 Develop and prepare the program of the	drill. Last RCD (3 rd RCD)	
regional collaboration drill with project	was conducted in Philippines	_
working group	in Dec, 2018. I-Speed was	
2-2 Conduct the regional collaboration	tested in the 3 rd RCD	
drill every year in AMS		
2-3 Compile recommendations on	So far, no cases for on-site	
regional collaboration on disaster health	practice	
management based on the discussion and	MDS was tested in the RCDs	
knowledge sharing through project activities	and was verified the	
2-4 On-site practice is conducted when	effectiveness.	
disaster occurs in ASEAN (if possible).		
Output 3 Tools for effective regional	PWG1&2 were set and	Final drafts will be
collaboration on disaster health	meetings were respectively	submitted to SOMHD.
management are developed.	held 7 times and 5 times	It is necessary to study
3-1 Formulate project working groups for	Drafts of SOP, MR, HNA were	ASEAN regional
regional collaboration tools at the beginning	developed. SOP, MR and	collective approach
of the project	HNA were finalized through	toward deployment of
3-2 Develop a draft regional SOP and	testing those tools in the RCD	ASEAN-EMT.
minimum requirements for disaster health	in Philippines and were	
management with the project working group	reviewed in the PWG1.	
3-3 Prepare databases of emergency		
medical teams of AMS	Template of DB for EMT was	
3-4 Draft framework of health needs	made. EMTs Data was	
assessment in emergencies with the project	collected from All AMS.	

working group		
Output 4 Academic network on disaster	Various Presentations on the	
health management in AMS is enhanced.	activities and outputs of	
4-1 Present outcomes of the Project	ARCH were made at the 13 th	
activities at academic conferences such as	and 14 th APCDM, 2 nd	
JADM, APCDM and WADEM	REMPAN Workshop, 22 nd	
	JADM annual meeting, and	
	WADEM	
Output 5 Capacity development activities	AMS trainings were	
for each AMS are implemented.	conducted 3times.	
5-1 Prepare training plan, curriculum and	Thai C/P training programs in	
materials on disaster health management	Japan were conducted twice.	
and emergency medical system based on	Study tour in Japan for key	
needs survey with the project working group	members from all AMS was	
5-2 Conduct trainings on disaster health	conducted in October 2018	
management and emergency medical	and the review meeting for	
service for AMS	the evaluation of the Project	
5-3 Conduct monitoring survey and	was held during the Study	
evaluation on capacity development on	tour.	
disaster health management in each AMS		
5-4 Conduct a study tour in Japan for AMS		
5-5 Conduct training program in Japan for		
the Thai counterpart personnel		

2) Accomplishment for Project Purpose

Project	Regional coordination on disaster health management is strengthened in
Purpose	ASEAN.
Verifiable	1 Coordination meetings on disaster health management in ASEAN are
Indicators	held on a regular basis.
	2 Activities needed for regional collaboration are clarified and approved
	in the coordination meeting.
	3 Recommendations for developing regional collaboration mechanism in
	disaster health management is proposed to the SOMHD.
	4 Regional collaboration tools are developed and approved in the
	coordination meeting.

Indicator1; Expected to be achieved. The RCC meetings were already held 4

times and one more meeting is scheduled to be held.

Indicator2; **Achieved.** Necessary activities of regional collaboration were clarified and the progress and products were reviewed in the RCC and PWG.

Indicator3; **Expected to be achieved.** The RCC and PWG have discussed not only on the directly related activities and outputs of the ARCH but also on the text of the ASEAN Leaders' Declaration (ALD) on Disaster Health Management and the Plan of Actions (POA) to implement the ALD in consideration of sustainability for regional collaboration after the project. The text of ALD and the POA drafted through the discussion in the RCC and the PWG were submitted to the Health Cluster 2 meetings and the SOMHD. The ALD was already adopted in the ASEAN Summit on Nov. 2107.

Indicator4; **Expected to be achieved.** The Regional Collaboration tools such as the SOP have been almost developed. Those tools will be submitted to the SOMHD in next April.

3) Accomplishment for Overall Goal

0, ,,,,,,,,	inplication of the an obtain
Overall Goal	ASEAN and Japan collaboration mechanism on disaster health
	management is developed.
Verifiable	1. Roadmap of ASEAN regional collaboration mechanism on disaster
Indicators	health management is finalized and proposed to SOMHD.
	2. Hub organization in-charge of coordination of ASEAN and Japan
	collaboration mechanism is identified, and its role is clarified.
	3. Necessary staff and budget of hub organization of ASEAN and Japan
	collaboration mechanism are proposed.
	4. Activities based on ASEAN and Japan collaboration mechanism will
	work if large scale disaster occurs.

Indicator1; Expected to be achieved.

The ASEAN Leaders' Declaration on Disaster Health Management (ALD DHM) was adopted on the occasion of the 31st ASEAN Summit in Philippines on 13 Nov. 2017. The Plan of Action (POA) to implement the ALDDHM (2018-2025) was drafted by leadership of Thailand and was submitted once to the SOMHD in April 2018. The RCC and PWG of ARCH have discussed to improve the POA and a revised version based on those discussions will be submitted again to the

SOMHD in April 2019.

Indicator2; Partially Achieved. Expected to be achieved after the project period

The Regional Coordination Committee (RCC) on DHM and the ASEAN Institute of DHM (AIDHM) were proposed as two important mechanisms to operationalize the POA. The RCCDHM and the AIDHM could be regarded as "Hub organization in-charge of coordination of ASEAN and Japan collaboration mechanism" referred in this Indicator. The draft of the Terms of Reference (TOR) for the RCC and the AIDHM were also discussed and polished in the Project. Although it is still necessary to continue negotiations and discussions among AMS on the RCC and AIDHM, if the discussions will be concluded, it can be said that this indicator would be satisfied.

ARCH has been conducting in close collaboration with the Japanese Advisory Committee and the JDR Secretariat as well as JDR registered members. In addition, several opportunities have been provided for the ARCH AMS members to participate and make presentations in the JADM and the APCDM. The network of practitioners and experts on disaster health management between AMS and Japan has been already strengthened through the ARCH.

ARCH took a very important role for the standardization of the Minimum Data Set (MDS) which is the I-EMT reporting format developed in collaboration between WHO and Japan (JICA and JDR members). Moreover, the i-SPEED which is a rapid information collection system for the Surveillance in Post Extreme Emergencies and Disasters (SPEED) of Philippines was tested by the Regional Coordination Drill of the ARCH. The i-Speed system was developed based on the Japanese system (J-SPEED) and is compatible with the MDS and has possibilities to largely improve the management on disaster health information in each AMS. The ARCH is expected to test the effectiveness and promote this i-SPEED in ASEAN.

Indicator3; Expected to be achieved after the project period.

After a host country for permanent secretariat of the RCCDHM and the AIDHM is decided and first meeting of the RCC is held and the AIDHM is established, this indicator could be said to be achieved.

Indicator4; uncertain

6.Implementation Process

Involvement of the Thai Ministry of Public Health (MOPH) in the ARCH hadn't been clear since the project started in July 2016. However, the MOPH is mainly responsible for contact with health sector bodies or meetings in ASEAN and WHO. In addition, the MOPH is responsible to set up the Emergency Operation Center (EOC) in the health sector if a large scale disaster occurs in Thailand. Moreover, MOPH should be responsible for overseas deployment of EMT. Therefore, it is essential to get commitment from the MOPH in some certain all the activities of the ARCH. Accordingly, the R/D of the project was amended on Aug. 2017, the Permanent Secretary and Director of Division of Public Health Emergency Management (DPHEM) of MOPH were assigned respectively as the Co-Project Director and the Co-Project Manager. The amended R/D also clarified the titles and organizations for the members of the Joint Coordination Committee (JCC) and stipulated that JICA should dispatch long-term experts who are responsible to improve the coordination with ASEAN bodies and WHO and to strengthen the collaboration among the MOPH, NIEM and JICA. The long-term expert (Chief Advisor) based on the amended R/D was dispatched in June 2018.

7. Five Evaluation Criteria

Relevance High; ASEAN is continuously the region where frequently occurs large scale disasters. ASEAN have been strengthening their efforts for disaster prevention/mitigation as well as rapid and effective disaster response. Regarding the disaster medicines which had not been approached enough in comparison with other sectors relating to disaster management in the ASEAN, as a result of the adoption of ALDDHM at the occasion of the ASEAN Summit last year, it can be expected that political priority for the Disaster Health Management could rise higher in this region than the situation before the project. Effectiveness Relatively High: Targets of all the indicators for the Project Purpose have been achieved or could be achieved by the end of the Project. The SOP and other tools developed by the project are very useful, but they are not sufficient for actual international deployment,

because EMTs of AMS have difficulties in meeting some elements of WHO I-EMT minimum standards, especially in the area of logistics, and their capabilities are not enough for self-sufficient international deployment.

✓ It is not certain how the participants of the AMS trainings and the RCDs have utilized their acquired knowledge or could contribute for capacity development on Disaster Health Management in each AMS.

Efficiency

Medium;

- ✓ The organizational commitment from Thai MOPH for the ARCH had not been clear even up to the latter part of the Project period.
- ✓ There are many relevant parties of Japan involved in the project implementation such as the Advisory Committee, the Consultant Team, Infrastructure and Peacebuilding Department of JICA and the Secretariat of Japan Disaster Relief Team. However, the roles and responsibilities of each party were not distinct and communication among the parties was somewhat confused in the first half of the project period.
- ✓ Because the participants for the RCC and PWG from each AMS were often changed, it was difficult to maintain the consistency of the sequence of discussions.
- It is not certain how the participants of the AMS trainings and the RCDs could contribute for the regional collaboration and capacity development on Disaster Health Management in the ASEAN and their home countries.

Impact

High;

- ✓ The ARCH has been able to have many opportunities to make presentations on the progress and outputs of the project and to publicize the importance of Disaster Health Management on the occasions of the ASEAN Summit, ASEAN Health Ministers Meeting, SOMHD or other important ASEAN meetings relating to the disaster management.
- ✓ The text of the ALD was drafted through a series of discussions in the RCC and PWG of the ARCH. ALD DHM was adopted on the occasion of the 31st ASEAN Summit in Philippines on 13 Nov. 2017 and the leaders of the ASEAN confirmed to strengthen the further

- efforts for Disaster Health Management in the ASEAN.
- ✓ Plan of Action (POA) to implement the ALDDHM (2018-2025) was drafted and was submitted once to the SOMHD in April 2018. The RCC and PWG of ARCH have discussed to improve the POA and a revised version based on those discussions will be submitted again to the SOMHD on April 2019. If the POA will be approved by the SOMHD and proceed into the implementation stage, it could be regarded that the ASEAN Collaboration Mechanism was developed and ASEAN is expected to be gradually strengthening the capacities of Disaster Health Management and be acquiring the capabilities of rapid and effective medical response for any large scale disasters in near future.
- MDS which JICA proposed WHO to develop and took the lead for the development was tested by the RCD of ARCH and its effectiveness was verified by the ARCH regional drills. MDS was officially adopted by WHO on Feb.2017 as an international standard. It is regarded that ARCH has also made a significant international contribution beyond the ASEAN region.
- ✓ Based on J-SPEED which was developed in Japan, referring to Philippine Method "SPEED", a Japanese company has developed i-SPEED system and that company is now trying to introduce its products to Philippines using JICA's Public-Private Partnership Program. ARCH worked to test the effectiveness of this rapid information collection system by the Regional Coordination Drill and introduced this i-SPEED system to other AMS. If the effectiveness will be verified and i-Speed will be utilized in this region, ARCH can contribute to improve the information management on Disaster Medicine.

Sustainability

High;

- ✓ The ALD was already adopted and the Leaders of the ASEAN
 have reconfirmed to strengthen the system and mechanism for the
 Disaster Health Management in each country as well as in the
 region as a whole. It could be expected that the political priority for
 the DHM will continue at a higher level.
- ✓ Once the POA will be approved, it is regarded that the RCC set up by the ARCH could expand its role and function, and upgrade to

- the RCCDHM which should be a permanent formal mechanism of the ASEAN.
- ✓ Once the SOP and other collaboration tools developed by the ARCH are endorsed by the SOMHD, those will be recognized as the official tools which should be continuously utilized in ASEAN. The integration of those tools into the SASOP, which is a most important official standard procedure for Humanitarian Assistance to disasters in ASEAN, could ensure the effective utilization for actual disaster cases. Moreover it is expected that the tools will be continuously effective for various cases in ASEAN in future because the RCCDHM set up by the POA would repeatedly review and improve and revise the tools if necessary.
- ✓ Once the POA is approved and AIDHM is established, implementation of RCD and AMS training courses which were initiated by the ARCH will be taken over to the AIDHM. AIDHM will be responsible to develop training curriculum and teaching materials as the regional training center on DHM, referencing the products of the ARCH. AIDHM will also play the role as the facilitator to enhance the Academic network on DHM
- ✓ It is regarded that the activities and products through the ARCH will be integrated into the part of the POA and be improved.

8.Conclusion

Most of the Activities have been implemented and the Outputs have been almost achieved as planned. Regarding the indicators for the Project Purpose, the Project has already achieved or can be expected to achieve all of the targets by the termination of the Project period. In addition, the Project has worked on the efforts beyond the Project Purpose and has made results in some extent toward the Overall Goal, which should be achieved several years after the termination of the Project period, and it is regarded that the Project has succeeded to generate a bigger Impact and to secure higher Sustainability than those expected before the Project. Then if the POA to implement the ALD is approved and the RCC & AIDHM to operationalize the POA start up, the Impact and Sustainability for the ARCH could be ensured further.

On the other hand, it is necessary to continue testing the products through the ARCH such as the collaboration tools or the RCD whether those can be functional

and effectively applied to an actual disaster. In addition, it is also necessary to improve the capacities on DHM in each AMS and to consider the regional collective measures in order to complement the incomplete capacities of AMS until each AMS could fulfill capabilities necessary for disaster medical response.

9.Recommendation

Based on the above conclusion, it is recommended that this ARCH Project should extend the cooperation period until the POA is approved and the main Mechanism of the POA (RCC & AIDHM) can start and get its actual activities on track so that the ARCH could ensure the Impact and Sustainability.

In addition, it is recommended that continuous testing for the tools and study on the capacity development needs in each AMS should be conducted and the regional approach to complement the capabilities of ASEAN-EMT should be discussed during the extension period.

Annex 1; Project Design Matrix(PDM)

Project Design Matrix (PDM): PROJECT FOR STRENGTHENING THE ASEAN REGIONAL CAPACITY ON DISASTER HEALTH MANAGEMENT

			as of 17 August, 2017
Narrative Summary	Objectively Verifiable Indicators	Means of Verification	Important Assumption
Overall Goal ASEAN and Japan collaboration mechanism on disaster health management is developed.	Roadmap of ASEAN regional collaboration mechanism on disaster health management is finalized and proposed to SOMHD. C. Hub organization in-charge of coordination of ASEAN and Japan collaboration mechanism is identified, and its role is clarified. Its role is clarified. 3. Necessary staff and budget of hub organization of ASEAN and Japan collaboration mechanism are proposed. 4. Activities based on ASEAN and Japan collaboration mechanism works if large scale disaster occurs.	Monitoring/review survey report Agreement documents in ASEAN SOMHD Summary of related meetings/ conferences (SOMHD or Summit etc)	
Project Purpose Regional coordination on disaster health management is strengthened in ASEAN.	1 Coordination meetings on disaster health management in ASEAN are held at regular basis. 2 Activities needed for regional collaboration are clarified and approved in the coordination meeting. 3 Recommendations for developing regional collaboration mechanism in disaster health management is proposed to SOMHD. 4 Regional collaboration tools are developed and approved in the coordination meeting.	Agreement and/or summary of coordination meeting	1 Policy of ASEAN on disaster health management is not changed. 2 Commitment from AMS is assured. 3 Serious political problem will not happen among ASEAN.
Output			
Output 1 Coordination platform on disaster health management is set up.	 1-1 Number of regional coordination meeting during the Project (Target: at least once a year) 1-2 Clarification of focal point of each AMS 1-3 Agreement of set-up of regional coordination platform on disaster health management in ASEAN 	1-1 and 1-3 Records of coordination meetings 1-2 List of focal points	1 Commitment of AMS for is assured.
Output 2 Framework of regional collaboration practices is developed.	2-1 Regional collaboration drill is conducted. (basically, once a year) 2-2 Recommendations/lessons learned for the regional collaboration drills are concluded. 2-3 Mechanism of regional collaboration of among emergency medical teams in disaster affected area is clarified.	2-1 Records of the regional collboration drills 2-2 Monitoring/review survey report 2-3 Draft regional agreement of the regional collaboration on disaster health management	1
Output 3 Tools for effective regional collaboration on disaster health management are developed.	3-1 Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) (draft) 3-2 Minimum requirements for disaster health management personnel (draft) 3-3 Framework of health needs assessment in emergencies (draft) 3-4 Preparation of database of emergency medical teams in ASEAN	3-1, 3-2, 3-3, and 3-4 Regional collaboration tools such as SOP, minimum requirement, framework of health needs assessment, database, Records of coordination meetings Monitoring/review survey report	
Output 4 Academic network on disaster health management in AMS is enhanced.	4-1 Number of presentation(s) made at academic conference(s) (Target: at least 1 paper/year)	4-1 Academic conference/journal such as JADM, APCDM, and WADEM	ī
Output 5 Capacity development activities for each AMS are implemented.	5-1 Number of trainings (Target, 4 courses) 5-2 Number of participants to attend to the training courses (Target 150 pax) 5-3 Lessons learned from the training courses was utilized in each AMS 5-4 Number of participants to attend to the counterpart training courses (Target :20 pax)	5-1 and 5-3 Training report(s) 5-2 Monitoring/review survey report 5-3 Training report(s)	ī
Activities	Inputs		
1-1 Regional coordination meetings are organized every year to share the progress and discuss the direction of the Project.	Japanese side	Thailand side	
2-1 Develop and prepare the program of the regional collaboration drill with project working group	[Experts] (1)Expert Consultant team	[Counterpart Personnel] 1.Project Director	
2-2 Conduct the regional collaboration drill every year in AMS 2-3 Commendations on regional collaboration on disaster health management based on the	(a) Dispatch of Experts 1.Leader 2.Specialist in medical system	2.Project Manager 3.Officer(s) in charge 4.Secretary at the project office	
assussion and known eggs snaming timough project activities 2-4 On site practice is conducted when disaster occurs in ASEAN (if possible).	3.5pedalast in dasaster health management/emergency medicine 4.5pedalast in planning/organizing regional collaboration drill 5. Ceneralize in about in section of the collaboration of the control of the collaboration of	[Facilities and Equipment]	
3-1 Formulate project working groups for regional collaboration tools at the beginning of the project	Subjectation in planning, organizing trainings 6. Project coordinator 6. Project coordinator	1.Project office space for JICA experts 2.Facilities and equipment necessary for	
3-2 Develop a draft regional SOP and minimum requirements for disaster health management with the project working group		trainings/regional drills 3.Equipment mutually agreed upon as necessary	
3-3 Prepare databases of emergency medical teams of AMS	[2] Japanese Advisory Committee 1. Provide advice and technical sunnort to IICA on the project management	[Available data and information related to	
3-4 Draft framework of health needs assessment in emergencies with the project working group	2. Join the project working groups and project management. 3 Participate in the acciding collapse.	project]	
4-1 Present outcomes of the Project activities at academic conferences such as JADM, APCDM and WADEM	4.Conduct advisory survey	[Local cost]	
5-1 Prepare training plan, curriculum and materials on disaster health management and emergency medical system based on needs survey with the project working group	Local cost Experies mititally agreed into a subsecsive	i.Expense mutually agreed upon as necessary	
5-2 Conduct trainings on disaster health management and emergency medical service for AMS	(incompared to the control of the co		
5-3 Conduct monitoring survey and evaluation on capacity development on disaster health management in each AMS			
5-4 Conduct a study tour in Japan for AMS			
5-5 Conduct training program in Japan for the Thai counterpart personnel			